# Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education

Vol 4, No.1, January 2023, DOI: <a href="https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v4i1.227">https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v4i1.227</a>
E-ISSN 2527-8177 pp. 22-36

# **Development of Islamic Religious Education Learning in Forming Moderate Muslims**

# A. Fatah Yasin<sup>1</sup>, Abdulloh Chakim<sup>2</sup>, Samsul Susilawati<sup>3</sup>, Suaib H. Muhammad<sup>4</sup>

- <sup>1</sup> Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, Indonesia: yasin.a.fattah@pai.uin-malang.ac.id
- <sup>2</sup> Universitas Islam Negeri Sayyid Ali Rahmatullah, Tulungagung Indonesia: chakim73@iaintulungagung.ac.id
- <sup>3</sup> Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, Indonesia: susilawati@pips.uin-malang.ac.id
- <sup>4</sup> Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, Indonesia: suaib@pai.uin-malang.ac.id

#### **Abstract**

Abstrak

Keywords: PAI Learning, Moderate Islamic Values, Covid-19 Pandemic

This study examines the implementation of moderate Islamic values in PAI learning amidst the COVID-19 pandemic at Islamic universities. The method used in this research is the qualitative method. Data were collected through observation, interviews, and documentation with descriptive-analytic analysis techniques. Research informants are PAI Lecturers, Students. The study was conducted in the even semester of 2020/2021 in January-June 2021 during the COVID-19 pandemic. The results of the study are that: (1) during the covid-19 pandemic the process of implementing moderate Islamic values (wasathiyah) about al-adl (justice), al-tawazun (balance), and al-tasamuh (tolerance) has been good and stable. takes place in PAI learning by using online, 2) Implementation of PAI learning by using online learning media WhatsApp, youtube increases the cognitive, affective aspects of students about Islamic moderation values. (3) the success of inculcating moderate Islamic values is reflected in the evaluation of student learning and behavior in the good category in the Department of Islamic Education, Faculty of Tarbiyah Sciences (FITK) State Islamic University of Malang.

**Kata kunci:**Pembelajaran PAI,
Nilai Islam Moderat,

Pandemi Covid-19.

Article history: Received: 14-11-2022 Revised 15-12-2022 Accepted 17-01-2023 pembelajaran PAI di tengah pandemi COVID-19 di perguruan tinggi Islam. Metode yang digunakan dalam penelitian ini adalah metode kualitatif. Data dikumpulkan melalui observasi, wawancara, dan dokumentasi dengan teknik analisis deskriptif-analitik. Informan penelitian adalah Dosen PAI, Mahasiswa. Penelitian dilakukan pada semester genap tahun ajaran 2020/2021 pada bulan Januari-Juni 2021 pada masa pandemi COVID-19. Hasil penelitian adalah: (1) pada masa pandemi covid-19 proses penerapan nilai-nilai Islam moderat (wasathiyah) tentang al-adl (keadilan), al-tawazun (keseimbangan), dan al-tasamuh (toleransi) telah sudah baik dan stabil. terjadi pada pembelajaran PAI dengan menggunakan online, 2) Implementasi pembelajaran PAI dengan menggunakan media pembelajaran online WhatsApp, youtube meningkatkan aspek kognitif, afektif siswa tentang nilai moderasi islami. (3) keberhasilan penanaman nilai-nilai keislaman sedang tercermin dari penilaian hasil belajar dan perilaku mahasiswa pada kategori baik di Jurusan Pendidikan Agama Islam

Fakultas Ilmu Tarbiyah (FITK) Universitas Islam Negeri Malang.

Kajian ini mengkaji implementasi nilai-nilai Islam moderat dalam

Corresponding Author: Samsul Susilawati

Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, Indonesia: susilawati@pips.uin-malang.ac.id

## **INTRODUCTION**

Today's understanding of Islamic values is urgent for the younger generation, including students.¹ The current phenomenon seems that the religious spirit of the millennial generation is not balanced with the understanding and breadth of religious knowledge.² Millennials fight for symbols but ignore the essence of religion itself.³ Therefore, it is necessary to have a deeper understanding of religious moderation from an early age to the millennial generation so that they have a polite attitude, like harmony, mutual respect, respect, and are willing to accept differences.⁴ In relation to the cultivation of values, the existence of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) courses plays an important key role.⁵ A moderate Islamic discourse is developing to counteract the growing intolerance and radicalism developed in Indonesian society. Islam is a religion of peace that is polite (*rahmatan lil-'alamin*), and the implementation of its values seems to be necessary in the learning process and in instilling values in classrooms.⁶ This is the background of the importance of research on implementing moderate Islamic values in PAI learning in Islamic universities.

Learning is basically an interaction process between educators and students, both direct (face-to-face) and indirect (*learning activities using learning media in web applications*),<sup>78</sup> learning during the COVID-19 pandemic. Online learning is an effective solution to activate classes even though schools have been closed considering that time and place are at risk during this pandemic.<sup>910</sup> However, this learning technique is important to evaluate according to local conditions considering the distribution of facilities and the ability of parents to provide different online learning facilities to students in Indonesia. In the midst of the COVID-19 pandemic, teaching and learning

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> D I Pondok Pesantrensalaf Al-falah and Nurwadjah Ahmad, 'NILAI-NILAI MODERASI BERAGAMA', no. Kawangung 2019 (n.d.): 43–51.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Kasinyo Harto and Tastin Tastin, 'Pengembangan Pembelajaran Pai Berwawasan Islam Wasatiyah: Upaya Membangun Sikap Moderasi Beragama Peserta Didik', *At-Ta'lim: Media Informasi Pendidikan Islam* 18, no. 1 (2019): 89, https://doi.org/10.29300/attalim.v18i1.1280.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Koko Adya et al., 'Moderasi Islam Dalam Pembelajaran PAI Melalui Model Pembelajaran Konstekstual Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung', *Ciencias*, *Jurnal Pengembangan Pendidikan* 3, no. 2 (2020): 82–92.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Munawar Rahmat, 'Model Perkuliahan Pendidikan Agama Islam Yang Damai, Moderat, Dan Toleran', *Nadwa* 12, no. 1 (2018): 39, https://doi.org/10.21580/nw.2018.12.1.2180.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Implementasi Nilai-nilai Moderasi Beragama and Sitti Chadidjah, '( Tinjauan Analisis Pada Pendidikan Dasar , Menengah Dan Tinggi ) Al-Hasanah: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam Al-Hasanah: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam 6 (n.d.).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Kenneth N Ross, Ilona Ross, Kenneth and Genevois, and Kenneth N Ross, *Cross-National Studies of the Quality of Education: Planning Their Design and Managing Their Impact*, 2006, https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203882146.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Mark Freeman et al., 'Factors Affecting Educational Innovation with in Class Electronic Response Systems', *Australasian Journal of Educational Technology* 23, no. 2 (2007): 149–70, https://doi.org/10.14742/ajet.1262.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Suzanne Stone and Anna Logan, 'Exploring Students' Use of the Social Networking Site WhatsApp to Foster Connectedness in the Online Learning Experience', *Irish Journal of Technology Enhanced Learning* 3, no. 1 (2018): 42–55, https://doi.org/10.22554/ijtel.v3i1.28.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Luh Devi Herliandry et al., 'Pembelajaran Pada Masa Pandemi Covid-19', JTP - Jurnal Teknologi Pendidikan 22, no. 1 (2020): 65–70, https://doi.org/10.21009/jtp.v22i1.15286.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Shivangi Dhawan, 'Online Learning: A Panacea in the Time of COVID-19 Crisis', *Journal of Educational Technology Systems* 49, no. 1 (2020): 5–22, https://doi.org/10.1177/0047239520934018.

activities at the Tarbiyah and Teacher Training Faculty, Maulana Malik Ibrahim State Islamic University Malang used an online learning model. Including PAI Learning.<sup>11</sup> The implementation of PAI learning and understanding of Islamic values today has become urgent for the younger generation, including students. The current phenomenon seems that the religious spirit of the millennial generation is not balanced with the understanding and breadth of religious knowledge. The millennial generation fights for symbols but ignores the essence of religion itself. 12 There needs to be a deeper understanding of religious moderation from an early age to the millennial generation so that they have a polite attitude, like harmony, mutual respect, respect, and are willing to accept differences.<sup>13</sup> Indonesian National Education aims to develop the potential of students to become human beings who believe and fear God Almighty, have a noble character, are healthy, knowledgeable, capable, creative, independent, and become democratic and responsible citizens.<sup>14</sup> In the process of educational activities, there is a curriculum as a tool for learning. Learning is a set of actions designed to support the learning process of students. In other words, the process of inculcating values in accordance with the national goals of education must be contained in the curriculum and the classroom learning process. This is the importance of research on implementing moderate values in the PAI learning process. 15

During the COVID-19 pandemic where teaching and learning activities are online, this research is also essential to do. The implementation of values, and the existence of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) courses in Islamic universities, especially the Islamic Religious Education department, plays an important key role. A

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Muhammad Anas Ma`arif, Muhammad Husnur Rofiq, and Akhmad Sirojuddin, 'Implementing Learning Strategies for Moderate Islamic Religious Education in Islamic Higher Education', *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 8, no. 1 (6 June 2022): 75–86, https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v8i1.19037; Ahmad Sodikin and Muhammad Anas Ma`arif, 'Penerapan Nilai Islam Moderat Dalam Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam Di Perguruan Tinggi', *EDUKASI: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Agama Dan Keagamaan* 19, no. 2 (27 August 2021): 188–203, https://doi.org/10.32729/edukasi.v19i2.702.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Adya et al., 'Moderasi Islam Dalam Pembelajaran PAI Melalui Model Pembelajaran Konstekstual Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Ja'far Amirudin et al., 'Implementation of The CTL Learning Model Through Islamic Moderate Values in Improving the Attitude of Students Tolerance in School', *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 5, no. 2 (2 June 2022): 690–703, https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v5i2.2201; Nuraan Davids, 'Islam, Moderation, Radicalism, and Justly Balanced Communities', *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs* 37, no. 3 (3 July 2017): 309–20, https://doi.org/10.1080/13602004.2017.1384672.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Harto and Tastin, 'Pengembangan Pembelajaran Pai Berwawasan Islam Wasatiyah: Upaya Membangun Sikap Moderasi Beragama Peserta Didik'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Rena Latifa et al., 'The Intention of Becoming Religiously Moderate in Indonesian Muslims: Do Knowledge and Attitude Interfere?', *Religions* 13, no. 6 (June 2022): 540, https://doi.org/10.3390/rel13060540; Muhammad Zuhdi, 'Challenging Moderate Muslims: Indonesia's Muslim Schools in the Midst of Religious Conservatism', *Religions* 9, no. 10 (October 2018): 310, https://doi.org/10.3390/rel9100310; Mirzon Daheri, 'Religious Moderation, Inclusive, and Global Citizenship as New Directions for Islamic Religious Education in Madrasah', *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 5, no. 1 (10 February 2022): 64–77, https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v5i1.1853.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Tatang Ibrahim, Siti Insani Akbari, and Siti Suaidah, 'Principal's Behavior in Strengthening Teacher Innovation and Creativity During The Covid-19 Pandemic', *Nidhomul Haq: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam 7*, no. 1 (3 April 2022): 116–24, https://doi.org/10.31538/ndh.v7i1.1813; Siti Maryam Munjiat, 'Implementation of Islamic Religious Education Learning in Higher Education on The Pandemic Period', *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam 3*, no. 2 (5 August 2020): 285–95, https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v3i2.757.

moderate Islamic discourse is developing to counteract the growing intolerance and radicalism developed in Indonesian society. Islam is a religion of peace that is polite (rahmatan lil-'alamin), and the cultivation of its values seems necessary in the learning process and in instilling values in the classrooms. This is the background of the importance of research on implementing moderate Islamic values in PAI learning at the State Islamic University of Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang majoring in Islamic Education. It is hoped that this research will be able to help provide an overview of how the process of implementing moderate Islamic values in Islamic universities.

#### **METHODS**

This study used a qualitative research approach<sup>1718</sup> a research method used to examine natural objects where the researcher is the key instrument, data collection techniques are carried out in a combined manner, data analysis is inductive, and qualitative research results emphasize meaning rather than generalization. The design of this research is descriptive research. 1920 The construction design of this research work includes two major things, namely, (1) the process of implementing moderate Islamic values in PAI learning, and (2) the success of the implementation process itself. Implementation of moderate Islamic values in the learning process. Moderate Islamic values here will be limited to the values of justice (al-'adl), balance (al-tawazun), and tolerance (al-tasamuh). The planting of moderate Islamic values will be explored for data and information. This is, of course, related to the current Covid-19 pandemic. The informants are lecturers in PAI courses and PAI students. This research was conducted with interviews, observation, and documentation.<sup>2122</sup> Hasil penggalian data dan informasi penelitian selanjutnya akan dianalisa.23 Data analysis is the process of systematically searching and compiling data obtained from interviews, field notes, and documentation, by organizing the data into categories, breaking them down into units, synthesizing them, arranging them into patterns, choosing what is important and what will be learned, and make conclusions so that they are easily understood by themselves and others.<sup>24</sup> The analysis process is carried out after going through a classification process in the form of grouping or collecting and categorizing data into predetermined

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> K Hammarberg, M Kirkman, and S De Lacey, 'Qualitative Research Methods: When to Use Them and How to Judge Them' 31, no. 3 (2016): 498–501, https://doi.org/10.1093/humrep/dev334.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Gregory T. Owen, 'Qualitative Methods in Higher Education Policy Analysis: Using Interviews and Document Analysis', *Qualitative Report* 19, no. 26 (2014): 1–19.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Sangeeta Sahney, Devinder Kumar Banwet, and Sabita Karunes, 'Enhancing Quality in Education: Application of Quality Function Deployment – an Industry Perspective', *Work Study* 52, no. 6 (2003): 297–309, https://doi.org/10.1108/00438020310496569.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Julia Metelkina and Ilona Gezalyan, 'The Quality of Education Concept', *International Workshop and Tutorials on Electron Devices and Materials*, EDM - Proceedings, 2006, 187–89, https://doi.org/10.1109/SIBEDM.2006.230595.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Carl Martin Allwood, 'The Distinction between Qualitative and Quantitative Research Methods Is Problematic', *Quality and Quantity* 46, no. 5 (2012): 1417–29, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11135-011-9455-8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Shoshanna Sofaer, 'Qualitative Research Methods' 14, no. 4 (2002): 329-36.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Ary Gumanti, . Yudiar, and . Syahruddin, Metode Penelitian Pendidikan, Jakarta: Mitra Wacana Merdeka, 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> H. Mudjia Rahardjo, 'Triangulasi Dalam Penelitian Kualitatif', Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, 2010, https://doi.org/10.1360/zd-2013-43-6-1064.

classes. Classification of data as the beginning of making changes from raw data to data utilization is the beginning of data interpretation for analysis. In analyzing the data using descriptive analytical techniques, that is, the data is described so that it can provide clarity in accordance with the reality in the field.<sup>25</sup>

The result of the analysis is a description of the situation under study in the form of a narrative description. This analysis is used by researchers to analyze the implementation of moderate Islamic values in learning Islamic religious education at FITK UIN Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang. The steps of analysis carried out while in the field are (1) data reduction; (2) data presentation; (3) conclusions, namely drawing conclusions and verification where researchers must base themselves on all data that has been obtained in research activities.

#### FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

Indonesian society is a society that we know is very diverse, meaning that there are various ethnic groups, languages, and customs, this term we call diversity (Bhardwaj, 2016). Indonesia is also known as a religious state, a country that requires its people to have a religion. Because of the variety of languages, customs, and ethnicities, the religions they follow are different, we call this term religiosity<sup>26</sup>. The two words that will be used in the writing of this article which may appear to be the same religion mean various religions and the diversity of various differences.

When we talk about moderation, there are two underlying theological concepts, namely <sup>27</sup> *Wasathiyah* concept sourced from the Qur'an Surah Al-Baqorah 143 is more accepted than the term moderation. Wasathiyah is an important aspect that is often forgotten by the ummah. Islam and other religions teach moderation. <sup>28</sup> *wasathiyah* and moderation concerning moral virtues relevant to individual life, society, the self-image of the community/state, and nation. <sup>29</sup> Moderation is a virtue that helps create social harmony and balance in personal, family, and community life and a broader spectrum of human relationships. <sup>30</sup> *Wasatiyah* means middle, impartial to the left and right, neutral. known for his moderate understanding that makes Islam different from other religions. *Wasathiyah* value has several aspects including the value of tawasut (moderation), *tasamuh* (tolerance), tawazun (balanced), *wathoniah wa muwathonah* (national value). <sup>31</sup> The second theological concept is the hadith of the prophet which

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Bachtiar S Bachri, 'Meyakinkan Validitas Data Melalui Triangulasi Pada Penelitian Kualitatif', *Teknologi Pendidikan*, 2010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Ross, Ross, Kenneth and Genevois, and Ross, Cross-National Studies of the Quality of Education: Planning Their Design and Managing Their Impact.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Ross, Ross, Kenneth and Genevois, and Ross.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Al-falah and Ahmad, 'NILAI-NILAI MODERASI BERAGAMA'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Abdul Syatar, Muhammad Majdy Amiruddin, and Arif Rahman, 'KURIOSITAS Media Komunikasi Sosial Dan Keagamaan' 5572, no. 11 (2018): 189–210.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Charl Wolhuter et al., 'JOURNAL OF RELIGIOUS EDUCATION Content5', Journal of Religious Education 57, no. 1 (2009): 25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Limas Dodi, M. Huda, and Sufirmansyah Sufirmansyah, 'Grounding the Vision of Religious Moderation as a Strategic Step in Preparing the Next Generation of the Nation towards Global Era', no. 7 (2021), https://doi.org/10.4108/eai.27-10-2020.2304176.

reads "the best thing is the middle (medium), Islamic teachings have the characteristics of *al-washatiyyah* (moderate) or *tawazun* (balance), a balance between two roads or two directions that are opposite or opposite.<sup>32</sup> This principle is in line with the nature of human creation, harmonious and harmonious nature.<sup>33</sup> This is also confirmed by the Qur'an in the letter Ar-Rahman verses 7-8, that Allah raised the sky, and placed *Mizan* (justice) to ensure that mankind would not exceed the limits.

Furthermore, wasathiyah has two key meanings<sup>34</sup> namely balanced (*tawazun*) and fair (*l'tidal*). *Tawazun* in everyday language is often called balanced, and i'tidal in everyday language is called fair. These two words have broad meanings. Fair (*i'tidal*) means taking sides with the truth or benefit, not taking sides with untruths, appropriate, appropriate, not arbitrary in acting in balance (*tawazun*) is a perspective on how to think, be consistent in favor of equality, justice, and humanity. This balanced character implies firmness in action, and still has gentleness, in the sense of not taking the rights of others, and not being excessive in attitude, especially in dealing with differences in both perspectives and attitudes. Discussion forums on religious moderation and diversity in 2019 are often held<sup>35</sup>, and more devoted to internalizing the values of moderation in education.<sup>36</sup> Educational institutions are trusted as a forum that can foster moderation education.

**Table 1:** Implementation of Moderate Islamic Values in Islamic Education Learning During the Covid-19 Pandemic in Higher Education

Moderate Islamic Values		PAI Learning	
✓ Fair		Daring	Covid-19 pandemic
✓ Humar	nism	Whats-App-Group	
✓ Cooper	ration	Youtube	
✓ Toleran	nt	Video	

The subject that is required to contain the values of moderation is Islamic religious education. The study of moderation for the millennial generation became an

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Yudhi Kawangung, 'Religious Moderation Discourse in Plurality of Social Harmony in Indonesia', *International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities* 3, no. 1 (2019): 160–70, https://doi.org/10.29332/ijssh.v3n1.277.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Ahmad Saefudin and Al Fatihah Al Fatihah, 'Islamic Moderation Through Education Characters of Aswaja An-Nahdliyyah', *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 3, no. 2 (2020): 160–79, https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v3i2.594.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Nirwana Nirwana and Waode Surya Darmadali, 'Instilling Religious Moderation Value in ELT through Cross-Cultural Understanding Course' 3, no. 2 (2021): 117–25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Murat Somer, 'Moderation of Religious and Secular Politics, a Country's "Centre" and Democratization', *Democratization* 21, no. 2 (2014): 244–67, https://doi.org/10.1080/13510347.2012.732069.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Sociology Education and Universitas Muhammadiyah, 'The Innovation and Creativity of Religious Moderation Learning Through Sociology Learning and Pancasila and Citizenship Education in Public Schools and Madrasas Gorontalo City' 6, no. 2 (2021): 232–42.

interesting conversation, carried out at the State Islamic University of Malang in the midst of the Covid-19 Pandemic via online using Whatsapp Group, and Youtube. Four principles need to be applied in moderation education, namely attitude; humanism, realistic, fair, cooperative and tolerant. There are four steps in the development of moderation in the millennial generation, namely 1) taking advantage of the development of social media technology in disseminating religious moderation information, 2) involving the millennial generation in positive activities in society, 3) the need for continuous dialogue in educational institutions, and 4) education. in family. Islam rahmatan lil alamin is a religion that has universal values that underlie human life throughout the ages. Moderate means a balanced pattern of thinking and interacting, in accordance with the principles of the Islamic Ageedah, worship and ethics by considering Islamic ethics which refers to the benefit of the people. On the other hand, diversity, and differences are natural occurrences, which everyone in this world also experiences. For example, America is a multi-ethnic and multi-cultural country, and America is relatively able to control its social conditions. Allah swt, sent the Apostles, books, and Shari'a for humans to live life in a world full of challenges in the form of trials, sorrows, and joys. These three things invite people to live in a peaceful world and the hereafter in accordance with a healthy fitrah with a human spirit. Human life instinctively needs balance, sunatullah everything in this world has the principle of pairing, day and night, sad and happy, and the principle of difference, differences in the concept of thinking, way of life, and way of acting. This principle and difference is certainly a blessing from Allah swt which must be accepted with kindness.

**Table 2.**Stages of Development of Moderate Values in Students

Im	plementation Stage	Moderation Value	Moderate Personal
<b>√</b>	Take advantage of the development of social media technology	Fair	Moderate patterns of thinking and balanced interaction, which are in accordance with the
✓	Involving the millennial generation in positive activities in the community	Humanisme	principles of Islamic Aqeedah, worship and ethics by considering Islamic ethics which refers
✓	There is a need for continuous dialogue in educational institutions	Cooperation	to the benefit of the people
<b>√</b>	Education in the family	Tolerant	

The concept of wasathiyah in the explanation above is specifically interpreted as the concept of balance and justice in religious moderation and diversity, widely expressed by experts, both linguists and religious experts, so that it becomes an

agreement that the concept of wasathiyah is rooted in moderation. The concept is further elaborated into the concept of religious moderation with various interpretations. wasathiyah into two concepts of fair and balanced. The two concepts derived from wasathiyah have the same intersection. So there is no doubt for us to see the truth of the concept of wasathiyah as a theological concept that gives birth to religious moderation and diversity. Indonesia is currently experiencing a disturbing social shock, in 2021, currently, in the midst of the Covid-19 pandemic there is a largescale demonstration carried out by Islamic groups accompanied by students in Jakarta and its surroundings. A deep understanding of radicalism is needed, so as not to be trapped in shallow ways of thinking. The emergence of the understanding of the occurrence of radicalism and extremism in Indonesia, including the threat of such understanding in universities. Radicalism and extremism arise due to 1) global politics, the invasion of large countries against Islamic countries is one cause of the emergence of radicalism in Islam, we know Al Qaeda and ISIS (Islamic countries in Iraq and Syria). 2) major state policies, 3) radicals arise because of global political discontent. 4) changes in the way of life, humans currently live in two worlds, namely the real world and the virtual world which presents a lot of information with bad content that vilifies one religion with another. So that one religion must stem or hinder other religions. There is a lot of religious information in terms of religious indictments in digital media, which is alleged to have come from extreme Islamic schools, the many truth values without a scientific basis and critical thinking are the right of everyone to have an opinion in the mass media. Give birth to new religious behavior in the virtual world and the real world. Moderation in Indonesia is possible because Indonesia has the largest Muslim population in the world, a strong pesantren tradition, and a high level of community religious observance.37

Due to the current situation that requires learning to be done online, the success rate can be measured through the activeness of students participating in online learning and student behavior when online learning is running.<sup>38</sup> The level of success can be measured from the habits of students in the school environment with good categories, this must always be applied in everyday life and can be used as a guide to student behavior or habits in everyday life because students follow the habits of lecturers or follow habituation theory and practice. The level of success can also be seen from the activities of students in the campus environment who respect each other's opinions and the religious community with good categories.<sup>39</sup>

The evaluation process to measure the level of success by lecturers is by assessing students through observation, self-assessment, and assessment between

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Robert W. Hefner, 'Islamic Radicalism in a Democratizing Indonesia', in *Routledge Handbook of Political Islam* (Routledge, 2011).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Pilar Martín-Hernández et al., 'Fostering University Students' Engagement in Teamwork and Innovation Behaviors through Game-Based Learning (GBL)', *Sustainability* 13, no. 24 (January 2021): 13573, https://doi.org/10.3390/su132413573.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Sri Wahyuni and Sanchita Bhattacharya, 'Strategy of Islamic Religious Education Teachers in Increasing Student Learning Motivation', *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education 2*, no. 2 (2 September 2021): 229–49, https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v2i2.22.

friends. This evaluation process was quite successful, because with the honesty of the students, the lecturers made it easier to assess the students' personalities. In terms of fairness, students always respect lecturers without being picky and don't choose friends in socializing. In terms of balance, students show an attitude of balance in getting along with their friends both in class and outside of class. In terms of tolerance, students understand the attitude of friends who have different characteristics and characters, are tolerant to friends and do not disturb their friends.<sup>40</sup> The existence of online learning carried out by the campus because in order to avoid adding to the number of victims from Covid-19, the researchers conducted interviews with students and lecturers who teach courses by means of online interviews. The researcher also asked for cooperation from Islamic Religious Education Lecturers to coordinate students as resource persons in this study.<sup>41</sup>

Regarding students' understanding of moderate Islamic values that have been conveyed by lecturers through materials, many have understood these values because these materials contain very detailed, brief, and not-too-long explanations. However, depending on the interest in learning on oneself who wants to understand or not? Not only that, lecturers also use electronic books about PAI material, so that these values are easier to understand.<sup>42</sup> Appropriate and varied learning media such as through video objects, stories, and others are very helpful for students to understand the material. In addition, lecturers also teach character education to instill values of justice, balance and tolerance. Not only providing material to read, but students are also asked to summarize and do practice questions and discuss solving a problem. By summarizing and reading, discussing students better understand the material presented. In addition, Lecturers also apply and provide examples of behavior.<sup>43</sup>

Before learning, the lecturer has provided material in the form of pdf and video files sent via WA Group. After that, they were given the task of summarizing the material. Then students do the evaluation and as a closing discussion is usually held. This is done in an effective and efficient timeframe. In online learning conditions, this can be easily understood, on the other hand there are students who think that the lecturer's explanation is not understandable because the explanation is not explained directly because the signal is not good and falters. There are many descriptions of student behavior regarding moderate Islamic values that reflect the values that are raised. There are some that have reflected and some are still not reflecting. Examples of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Muassomah Muassomah et al., 'The Academic Demoralization of Students in Online Learning During the COVID-19 Pandemic', *Frontiers in Education* 7 (31 May 2022): 888393, https://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2022.888393.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Munaya Ulil Ilmi et al., 'The Basic Concepts of Evaluation and Its Implementation in IRE Lessons in The Pandemic Era', *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education* 2, no. 2 (30 July 2021): 175–90, https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v2i2.50.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Muhammad Anggung Manumanoso Prasetyo and Muhammad Ilham, 'Leadership in Learning Organization of Islamic Boarding School After Covid-19 Pandemic', *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education* 3, no. 2 (22 August 2022): 163–80, https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v3i2.175.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Anis Sandria, Hasyim Asy'ari, and Fahmi Siti Fatimah, 'Pembentukan Karakter Religius Melalui Pembelajaran Berpusat Pada Siswa Madrasah Aliyah Negeri', *At-Tadzkir: Islamic Education Journal* 1, no. 1 (5 October 2022): 63–75.

those that already reflect such as participating in online learning via Whatsap Group, if there is one person who is having trouble dealing with a question or asking how it is done, everyone helps each other, for example in the form of a file and there is one friend who can't download the file, another friend will definitely participate and will send the file to a friend who is in need or having trouble downloading the file in the form of material. Because the current situation and conditions do not allow us to often gather together, therefore we tolerate each other virtually.<sup>44</sup>

Learning activities are carried out using an online system and have never met each other in learning. But with class Whatsapp groups, YouTube, and Facebook, students can observe each other's behavior. They greet each other, exchange stories, and share experiences and they help each other. In addition, they also remind each other about the tasks on that day. They don't differentiate between each other, if someone asks a question in the group, many will respond. Even during the online learning period, student behavior can be judged from the words sent in a message to ask questions or jokes. Students are fair to each other and accept differences in everything. Moderate, as a form of wisdom in the attitude of someone who is religious, because in principle all religions instill goodness. The first, balance as a middle attitude, means not taking sides anywhere. In this way, humans will be able to respond wisely and impartially. Second, justice is the hope of all mankind. Only with justice will man attain peace. And third, tolerance is the embeddedness of religious values in a person.

Justice means not discriminating between one another. And truth always triumphs over evil. Justice is also not indiscriminate, justice must all be equal. Balance means being able to balance each other, an example of a class that does not have a balance value is one of the children who has a selfish nature, does not want to accept other people's opinions. Tolerance means being able to respect differences in religion, race, culture, and the economic level of each family. Because there is no perfect human in this world. Tolerance must be applied wherever and whenever, for example on campus. Other opinions, justice is doing justice to others and not discriminating, tolerance is respecting each other, balance is the same or not doing too much of something.<sup>45</sup>

The value of tolerance is an attitude of respect or respect for one another. While the value of balance is about the implementation of rights and obligations between fellow human beings, for example doing good. If the value of justice is values related to obligations that must be fair and measurable equally between people. The value of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Akhmad Halim Ilmanto, Eni Fariyatul Fahyuni, and Arman Harahap, 'The Problems of Online Learning: The Role of Parents During The Covid-19 Pandemic', *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 4, no. 2 (1 July 2021): 284–93, https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v4i2.1471; Fitri Oviyanti, Hasse Jubba, and Zuhdiyah Zuhdiyah, 'Disharmony of Parents and Children in an Online Learning during the Covid-19 Pandemic in Indonesia', *Nadwa: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 15, no. 2 (31 December 2021): 149–68, https://doi.org/10.21580/nw.2021.15.2.9643.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Ahmad Nashihin Agus Saputro and Abu Darim, 'Strategi Kepala Sekolah Dalam Kebijakan Pembelajaran Pada Masa Pandemi Covid-19 Di Sekolah Dasar', *Kharisma: Jurnal Administrasi Dan Manajemen Pendidikan* 1, no. 1 (26 October 2022): 36–47.

justice is values related to rights and obligations that must be fair and measurable equally between people. The value of balance is carrying out the rights and obligations as proportional citizens, not imposing the will, mutual tolerance, mutual help, harmony, peace, respect, differences in religion and belief, friendship, and defending and protecting the weak. So, seeing anything, we must be balanced, not be extreme at one pole. Because in that way justice will be realized, and we will become tolerant and moderate. In addition, some factors support the implementation of moderate Islamic values, namely the openness between students and lecturers to form a sense of mutual care and solve problems together. Environmental aspects are also very influential in supporting the implementation of moderate Islamic values.

## **CONCLUSION**

Implementing moderate Islamic values at the Faculty of Tarbiyah Sciences (FITK) of the State Islamic University of Malang was generally carried out well. Judging from the value of justice, universities make this value the basis for working and acting. To achieve the value of balance, make worship habits such as praying, praying dzuhur in the congregation, and applying clothes that cover the genitals. The implementation of moderate Islamic values has been instilled in PAI learning. Through online learning during this covid-19 pandemic, the cultivation of balanced values in PAI learning is realized using WhatsApp Group media, YouTube, and Facebook.

Islamic moderation is a middle way between the use of revelation (naqliyah) and ratio ('aqliyah) so that it is possible to adjust to societal changes as long as it does not oppose and contradict dogmatic doctrines. Islam wasathiyah (moderation of Islam) understands and acknowledges the differences that may occur in society. Islamic teachings have qualified moderation principles that students must understand through the PAI learning process.

The principles of Islamic moderation are justice, balance, tolerance, diversity, and exemplary. One of the efforts that PAI lecturers can make in carrying out the Islamic moderation learning process which is considered effective during the current pandemic-civud-19 is through online media using YouTube, Facebook, WhatsApp-Groups. Through online media and online learning, the implementation of moderate values in students can be carried out well so that students have Islamic moderation insight, understanding, and awareness and are encouraged to actualize them in their community.

## REFERENCES

Adya, Koko, I Solihin, Uus Ruswandi, Mohamad Erihadiana, and Buana. 'Moderasi Islam Dalam Pembelajaran PAI Melalui Model Pembelajaran Konstekstual Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung'. *Ciencias , Jurnal Pengembangan Pendidikan* 3, no. 2 (2020): 82–92.

Al-falah, D I Pondok Pesantrensalaf, and Nurwadjah Ahmad. 'NILAI-NILAI MODERASI BERAGAMA', no. Kawangung 2019 (n.d.): 43–51.

- Allwood, Carl Martin. 'The Distinction between Qualitative and Quantitative Research Methods Is Problematic'. *Quality and Quantity* 46, no. 5 (2012): 1417–29. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11135-011-9455-8.
- Amirudin, Ja'far, Uus Ruswandi, Mohamad Erihadiana, and Elis Rohimah. 'Implementation of The CTL Learning Model Through Islamic Moderate Values in Improving the Attitude of Students Tolerance in School'. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 5, no. 2 (2 June 2022): 690–703. https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v5i2.2201.
- Bachri, Bachtiar S. 'Meyakinkan Validitas Data Melalui Triangulasi Pada Penelitian Kualitatif'. *Teknologi Pendidikan*, 2010.
- Beragama, Implementasi Nilai-nilai Moderasi, and Sitti Chadidjah. '( Tinjauan Analisis Pada Pendidikan Dasar , Menengah Dan Tinggi ) Al-Hasanah: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam Al-Hasanah: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam' 6 (n.d.).
- Daheri, Mirzon. 'Religious Moderation, Inclusive, and Global Citizenship as New Directions for Islamic Religious Education in Madrasah'. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 5, no. 1 (10 February 2022): 64–77. https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v5i1.1853.
- Davids, Nuraan. 'Islam, Moderation, Radicalism, and Justly Balanced Communities'. *Journal of Muslim Minority Affairs* 37, no. 3 (3 July 2017): 309–20. https://doi.org/10.1080/13602004.2017.1384672.
- Dhawan, Shivangi. 'Online Learning: A Panacea in the Time of COVID-19 Crisis'. *Journal of Educational Technology Systems* 49, no. 1 (2020): 5–22. https://doi.org/10.1177/0047239520934018.
- Dodi, Limas, M. Huda, and Sufirmansyah Sufirmansyah. 'Grounding the Vision of Religious Moderation as a Strategic Step in Preparing the Next Generation of the Nation towards Global Era', no. 7 (2021). https://doi.org/10.4108/eai.27-10-2020.2304176.
- Education, Sociology, and Universitas Muhammadiyah. 'The Innovation and Creativity of Religious Moderation Learning Through Sociology Learning and Pancasila and Citizenship Education in Public Schools and Madrasas Gorontalo City' 6, no. 2 (2021): 232–42.
- Freeman, Mark, Amani Bell, Carole Comerton-Forde, Joanne Pickering, and Paul Blayney. 'Factors Affecting Educational Innovation with in Class Electronic Response Systems'. *Australasian Journal of Educational Technology* 23, no. 2 (2007): 149–70. https://doi.org/10.14742/ajet.1262.
- Gumanti, Ary, . Yudiar, and . Syahruddin. *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan*. *Jakarta* : *Mitra Wacana Merdeka*, 2016.
- H. Mudjia Rahardjo. 'Triangulasi Dalam Penelitian Kualitatif'. Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, 2010. https://doi.org/10.1360/zd-2013-43-6-1064.

- Hammarberg, K, M Kirkman, and S De Lacey. 'Qualitative Research Methods: When to Use Them and How to Judge Them' 31, no. 3 (2016): 498–501. https://doi.org/10.1093/humrep/dev334.
- Harto, Kasinyo, and Tastin Tastin. 'Pengembangan Pembelajaran Pai Berwawasan Islam Wasatiyah: Upaya Membangun Sikap Moderasi Beragama Peserta Didik'. *At-Ta'lim: Media Informasi Pendidikan Islam* 18, no. 1 (2019): 89. https://doi.org/10.29300/attalim.v18i1.1280.
- Hefner, Robert W. 'Islamic Radicalism in a Democratizing Indonesia'. In *Routledge Handbook of Political Islam*. Routledge, 2011.
- Herliandry, Luh Devi, Nurhasanah Nurhasanah, Maria Enjelina Suban, and Heru Kuswanto. 'Pembelajaran Pada Masa Pandemi Covid-19'. *JTP Jurnal Teknologi Pendidikan* 22, no. 1 (2020): 65–70. https://doi.org/10.21009/jtp.v22i1.15286.
- Ibrahim, Tatang, Siti Insani Akbari, and Siti Suaidah. 'Principal's Behavior in Strengthening Teacher Innovation and Creativity During The Covid-19 Pandemic'. *Nidhomul Haq: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam* 7, no. 1 (3 April 2022): 116–24. https://doi.org/10.31538/ndh.v7i1.1813.
- Ilmanto, Akhmad Halim, Eni Fariyatul Fahyuni, and Arman Harahap. 'The Problems of Online Learning: The Role of Parents During The Covid-19 Pandemic'. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 4, no. 2 (1 July 2021): 284–93. https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v4i2.1471.
- Ilmi, Munaya Ulil, Farid Setiawan, Maulida Nurul Hikmah, Arrum Kharisma, Dimas Feryawan, and Aiman Affan Hanafie. 'The Basic Concepts of Evaluation and Its Implementation in IRE Lessons in The Pandemic Era'. *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education* 2, no. 2 (30 July 2021): 175–90. https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v2i2.50.
- Kawangung, Yudhi. 'Religious Moderation Discourse in Plurality of Social Harmony in Indonesia'. *International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities* 3, no. 1 (2019): 160–70. https://doi.org/10.29332/ijssh.v3n1.277.
- Latifa, Rena, Muhamad Fahri, Imam Subchi, and Naufal Fadhil Mahida. 'The Intention of Becoming Religiously Moderate in Indonesian Muslims: Do Knowledge and Attitude Interfere?' *Religions* 13, no. 6 (June 2022): 540. https://doi.org/10.3390/rel13060540.
- Ma`arif, Muhammad Anas, Muhammad Husnur Rofiq, and Akhmad Sirojuddin. 'Implementing Learning Strategies for Moderate Islamic Religious Education in Islamic Higher Education'. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 8, no. 1 (6 June 2022): 75–86. https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v8i1.19037.
- Martín-Hernández, Pilar, Marta Gil-Lacruz, Ana I. Gil-Lacruz, Juan Luis Azkue-Beteta, Eva M. Lira, and Luis Cantarero. 'Fostering University Students' Engagement in Teamwork and Innovation Behaviors through Game-Based Learning (GBL)'. Sustainability 13, no. 24 (January 2021): 13573. https://doi.org/10.3390/su132413573.

- Metelkina, Julia, and Ilona Gezalyan. 'The Quality of Education Concept'. *International Workshop and Tutorials on Electron Devices and Materials, EDM Proceedings*, 2006, 187–89. https://doi.org/10.1109/SIBEDM.2006.230595.
- Muassomah, Muassomah, Irwan Abdullah, Umdatul Hasanah, Dalmeri Dalmeri, Adison Adrianus Sihombing, and Luis Rodrigo. 'The Academic Demoralization of Students in Online Learning During the COVID-19 Pandemic'. *Frontiers in Education* 7 (31 May 2022): 888393. https://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2022.888393.
- Munjiat, Siti Maryam. 'Implementation of Islamic Religious Education Learning in Higher Education on The Pandemic Period'. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 3, no. 2 (5 August 2020): 285–95. https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v3i2.757.
- Nirwana, Nirwana, and Waode Surya Darmadali. 'Instilling Religious Moderation Value in ELT through Cross-Cultural Understanding Course' 3, no. 2 (2021): 117–25.
- Oviyanti, Fitri, Hasse Jubba, and Zuhdiyah Zuhdiyah. 'Disharmony of Parents and Children in an Online Learning during the Covid-19 Pandemic in Indonesia'. *Nadwa: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 15, no. 2 (31 December 2021): 149–68. https://doi.org/10.21580/nw.2021.15.2.9643.
- Owen, Gregory T. 'Qualitative Methods in Higher Education Policy Analysis: Using Interviews and Document Analysis'. *Qualitative Report* 19, no. 26 (2014): 1–19.
- Prasetyo, Muhammad Anggung Manumanoso, and Muhammad Ilham. 'Leadership in Learning Organization of Islamic Boarding School After Covid-19 Pandemic'. *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education* 3, no. 2 (22 August 2022): 163–80. https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v3i2.175.
- Rahmat, Munawar. 'Model Perkuliahan Pendidikan Agama Islam Yang Damai, Moderat, Dan Toleran'. *Nadwa* 12, no. 1 (2018): 39. https://doi.org/10.21580/nw.2018.12.1.2180.
- Ross, Kenneth N, Ilona Ross, Kenneth and Genevois, and Kenneth N Ross. *Cross-National Studies of the Quality of Education: Planning Their Design and Managing Their Impact*, 2006. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203882146.
- Saefudin, Ahmad, and Al Fatihah Al Fatihah. 'Islamic Moderation Through Education Characters of Aswaja An-Nahdliyyah'. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 3, no. 2 (2020): 160–79. https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v3i2.594.
- Sahney, Sangeeta, Devinder Kumar Banwet, and Sabita Karunes. 'Enhancing Quality in Education: Application of Quality Function Deployment an Industry Perspective'. *Work Study* 52, no. 6 (2003): 297–309. https://doi.org/10.1108/00438020310496569.
- Sandria, Anis, Hasyim Asy'ari, and Fahmi Siti Fatimah. 'Pembentukan Karakter Religius Melalui Pembelajaran Berpusat Pada Siswa Madrasah Aliyah Negeri'. *At-Tadzkir: Islamic Education Journal* 1, no. 1 (5 October 2022): 63–75.
- Saputro, Ahmad Nashihin Agus, and Abu Darim. 'Strategi Kepala Sekolah Dalam Kebijakan Pembelajaran Pada Masa Pandemi Covid-19 Di Sekolah Dasar'.

- Kharisma: Jurnal Administrasi Dan Manajemen Pendidikan 1, no. 1 (26 October 2022): 36-47.
- Sodikin, Ahmad, and Muhammad Anas Ma`arif. 'Penerapan Nilai Islam Moderat Dalam Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam Di Perguruan Tinggi'. EDUKASI: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Agama Dan Keagamaan 19, no. 2 (27 August 2021): 188–203. https://doi.org/10.32729/edukasi.v19i2.702.
- Sofaer, Shoshanna. 'Qualitative Research Methods' 14, no. 4 (2002): 329–36.
- Somer, Murat. 'Moderation of Religious and Secular Politics, a Country's "Centre" and Democratization'. *Democratization* 21, no. 2 (2014): 244–67. https://doi.org/10.1080/13510347.2012.732069.
- Stone, Suzanne, and Anna Logan. 'Exploring Students' Use of the Social Networking Site WhatsApp to Foster Connectedness in the Online Learning Experience'. *Irish Journal of Technology Enhanced Learning* 3, no. 1 (2018): 42–55. https://doi.org/10.22554/ijtel.v3i1.28.
- Syatar, Abdul, Muhammad Majdy Amiruddin, and Arif Rahman. 'KURIOSITAS Media Komunikasi Sosial Dan Keagamaan' 5572, no. 11 (2018): 189–210.
- Wahyuni, Sri, and Sanchita Bhattacharya. 'Strategy of Islamic Religious Education Teachers in Increasing Student Learning Motivation'. *Tafkir: Interdisciplinary Journal of Islamic Education* 2, no. 2 (2 September 2021): 229–49. https://doi.org/10.31538/tijie.v2i2.22.
- Wolhuter, Charl, Johannes Van der Walt, Ferdinand Page, Richard Rymarz, and Brendan Hyde. 'JOURNAL OF RELIGIOUS EDUCATION Content5'. *Journal of Religious Education* 57, no. 1 (2009): 25.
- Zuhdi, Muhammad. 'Challenging Moderate Muslims: Indonesia's Muslim Schools in the Midst of Religious Conservatism'. *Religions* 9, no. 10 (October 2018): 310. https://doi.org/10.3390/rel9100310.