Menyama Braya: Balinese Hindu-Muslim Ethnoreligious construction in the creation of peace education

Moch. Khafidz Fuad Raya, Vialinda Siswati, Akhmad Nurul Kawakip, Amin Tohari, Wawan Herry Setyawan & M. Mukhibat

Published online: 22 Aug 2023.

Submit your article to this journal ⬀

Article views: 168

View related articles ⬀

View Crossmark data ⬀

CULTURAL HERITAGE | REVIEW ARTICLE

Menyama Braya: Balinese Hindu-Muslim Ethnoreligious construction in the creation of peace education

Moch. Khafidz Fuad Raya[1*], Vialinda Siswati[2], Akhmad Nurul Kawakip[3], Amin Tohari[4], Wawan Herry Setyawan[5] and M. Mukhibat[6]

Abstract: This research discusses the *menyama-braya* tradition to construct ethnoreligious between Balinese Hindus and two Muslim ethnicities who inhabit Bali (Sasak Muslim ethnicity and Bugis Muslim ethnicity) in an effort of peace education. When ethnic and religious differences become an arena for division, *menyama-braya* offers a peaceful solution that brings the two together. In this context, this article discusses the practice of *menyama-braya* in religious rituals and educational institutions. In religious rituals, *menyama-braya* is present in *ngaben* (the cremation tradition) and religious day ceremonies of each religion). Whereas in educational institutions, the *Puja Trisanda* prayer and *salam*, Hindu involvement in MTQ; *ngejot* and *ngotonin* program, and the *Rodat dance*

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Moch. Khafidz Fuad Raya is a professor and senior researcher at the Center for the Study of Muslim Society in Malang, East Java. In 2019, the author received his doctorate from UIN Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang. He has been the Director of the Center for the Study of Muslim Society since 2020. His major research interest currently focuses on the anthropology of culture and religion, religious studies, studies of Inter-religious relations, and Islamic education. He has published his research results to leading publishers such as Springer, Taylor and Francis, and Cambridge University.

Vialinda Siswati is a lecturer at the Department of Islamic Education Faculty of Islamic Institute of Darullughah Wadda'wah, Pasuruan. Her received doctorate in Islamic Education from Maulana Malik Ibrahim State Islamic University in Malang, Indonesia. Her major research interests are Islamic education.

Akhmad Nurul Kawakip was born in Rembang, Indonesia, on July 31st, 1975. He is a lecturer and researcher for the State Islamic University of Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, East Java, Indonesia. He teaches issues on the sociology of education, Islamic educational thought and ethnography of the Islamic educational system. He got a Master's degree in Asia and Pacific Studies from Victoria University Melbourne, Australia. In 2018, he completed his doctoral degree at the State Islamic University of Sunan Ampel Surabaya, East Java, Indonesia.

Amin Tohari is a lecturer in the Department of Sociology, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences at Sunan Ampel State Islamic University Surabaya. In 2020 he completed his doctoral studies at the University of Muhammadiyah Malang. Some of his writings are about rural sociology and the sociology of Muslim society. He is also one of the researchers at the Center for the Study of Muslim Society.

Wawan Herry Setyawan is an Assistant Professor at the Teaching Faculty of Education at the Islamic University of Kadiri, Kediri. He completed the Doctoral Program in Educational Technology at Surabaya State University in 2019. He has been an expert facilitator/trainer for implementing the Independent Learning Curriculum from 2021-2023.

M. Mukhibat is an Associate Professor at the Faculty of Tarbiyah and Teacher Training at the Ponorogo State Islamic Institute, with a great interest in research on Islamic Education Management, Education Policy, Learning Management, and Curriculum Development Management.

extracurricular. This finding shows how *menyama-braya* forms a unique identity that we call an *ethnoreligious hybrid*. This study extrapolates important patterns of peacebuilding in Asia, bearing in mind that Bali, as the world's peacemaker, offers peace education that mobilises cultural diversity from different ethnicities and religions in one hybrid tradition.

Subjects: Regional Anthropology; Issues; Culture; Heritage; History; Religion

Keywords: menyama-braya; Hindu-Muslim; ethnoreligious; peace education; cultural diversity

1. Introduction

Bali is the most popular city in the world as an international tourist destination that is most in demand (Adhika, 2021; Mastika & NIMRAN, 2020; Pamungkas et al., 2020). Its natural and cultural wealth invites many tourists worldwide to visit Bali (Dunbar-Hall, 2001; McKean, 2011; Picard, 2008). This preference became contradictory when Bali was shaken by the Bali I and II Bali Bombings on 12 October 2002 and 1 October 2005 by terrorists (Korstanje, 2011). Bali is the most tragic city; both nights witnessed how sad terrorism destroyed Bali. Sublimation effects on the economy, security and stability of the country, as well as prolonged psychological effects, are felt by the victims affected by the bombing as well as their family members and surrounding communities (Brookes, 2014; Hutchison, 2010; G. Stevens et al., 2013). Psychologically recovering from the bloody incident took a very long time (Kruglanski, 2013; G. J. Stevens et al., 2013).

The highlight of this problem is that Bali is one of Indonesia's provinces with a majority population of Hindus (83.5%). In comparison, Islam is the religion of most of the population living in Bali (13.3%). This reality is what makes Bali nicknamed the "Island of the Gods" or "Balinese Hindu", which makes it better known as a Hindu city in Indonesia (Dibia, 1985; Picard, 2011). Whereas a group of Muslims carries out acts of terrorism, this tarnishes the face of Islam through radicalism so that the public's perception of its adherents is bad (Sunesti, 2014).

The psychological effect is the biggest impact felt by Balinese people and foreign tourists. They must face an uncertain atmosphere in every city corner, remembering the bloody incident. The second bombing was followed in 2005, which made the international community even more afraid of being in Bali. Various attempts have been made for psychological recovery when people experience great pressure (Edgar et al., 2005; Lewis, 2008). Stevens et al. researched mental and physical health after the Bali Bombing. Some 68% of 115 respondents experienced high psychological trauma with traumatic symptoms such as stress, vulnerability to personal resilience, and PTSD. The family loss factor is the strongest correlation between traumatic symptoms (G. J. G. Stevens et al., 2013), so psychological therapy is needed for a very long period (Edgar et al., 2005). These conditions create a new trend of community formation to denounce these radical actions where they are groups that are formed collectively and even hate Muslims (Hutchison, 2010). This opinion[1] leads the public to believe that Islam is intolerant, considering that other religions are not recognized in their teachings. This results in greater strain on the relationship between Hindus and Muslims.

Political stability between Indonesia and its relational countries was also bad, destroying the tourism sector (Gurtner, 2004). This heartbreaking incident 19 years ago left deep wounds in the international community and hurt Hindu-Islam relations in Bali. Islam is generalized as a terrorist religion (Acharya, 2006), so it becomes a target and social exile. Until now, the movement of Muslims in social activities is limited. They must respect every social aspect, such as thoughts, actions and public policies of other religions, for survival in Bali. Religious tolerance is a solution that must be implemented by adherents of both religions (Hindu-Muslims) in which they are not

allowed to force others to follow a certain religion, criticize other adherents or religions, and disrupt religious rituals of worship.

This article aims to further discuss Hindu-Muslim relations through a tradition called "*menyama-braya*". This tradition forms a Hindu-Muslim social-cultural relationship to strengthen solidarity and tolerance and create peace. The social relations formed are embodied in cultural systems maintained from generation to generation through religious rituals and manifestations in formal educational institutions. This paper focuses on the forms of *menyama-braya* in religious rituals (such as *ngaben*[2] and religious day ceremonies of each religion) and formal educational institutions (respect for the *Puja Trisanda* prayer and *salam*, Hindu involvement in MTQ; *ngejot* and *ngotonin* program, and *Rodat dance* extracurriculars) as a material for constructing ethnoreligious in the formation of peace education. *Menyama-braya* is considered an embodiment of peace-building between ethnic-religious cases. This study aims to extrapolate important patterns of naturalistic ethnoreligious construction through the tradition of *menyama-braya* which synthesises solidarity and tolerance in various religious rituals and formal educational institutions.

2. Method

Ethnoreligious has received less serious attention as a formation or peace education effort. At least Amanda Fish has reviewed it recently, published in 2022. However, this study is limited to ethnic conflicts (in the case of the Uighur-Han ethnic group in Xinjiang, China) (Fish, 2022). To provide a distinction between ethnic-religious localities, Balinese, inter-religious relations, and education, this research borrows Raya and Hefner's approach (Hefner, 2003; Raya, 2022), wherein the context of embracing these four elements forms Balinese Hindu ethnic ways by Sasak Muslim ethnicity and Bugis Muslim ethnicity constructs an ethnoreligious hybrid in a peace effort. The dimension of minority Muslim locality at the heart of Balinese Hindu civilisation and how the relationship between religions is a brand of religion-culture that is often forgotten and contradictory, where many studies focus on the Javanese dimension as the centre of civilisation. Meanwhile, Hefner made the ethnic-religious brand a religious education introduced in schools. It started with Parisada Hindu Dharma which was approved by the government to be taught in public schools in East Java. The two approaches are combined to obtain an important pattern extrapolation in constructing peace education in Bali.

This research uses a case study (Yin, 2009) where peace education is shaped by a casuistic ethnoreligious construction, where *menyama-braya* occurs in the context of minorities-majorities in different ethnicities. Data collection was carried out using observation and documentation as the main methods; these two methods are expedition tools and experiments where phenomena in the field are variations of cultural laboratory materials that can be validated (Klemun & Spring, 2016). Observations were made at several different locations. First, in Nyuling village, Danginsema village, Serangan Island, Tanjung Benoa, Kepaon, Tuban and Angantiga villages. Both at school, SMAN 1 Denpasar, SMAN 3 Denpasar, SMAN 4 Denpasar, and SMPN 11 Denpasar. Third, at the Regional Office (Kanwil) of the Ministry of Religion, Province of Bali. Meanwhile, the *Menyama-Braya* magazine was chosen as the object of documentation obtained from the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion of the Province of Bali. Interviews were also conducted with one of the Muslim residents in Tuban during the death ceremony using the *menyama-braya* tradition.

Miles and Huberman used data analysis (Miles et al., 2018). During the data analysis process, the researcher collected data from the main method (observation and documentation) and then supported it with interview data. After that, the data is reduced so that the extrapolation patterns can be grouped according to the studied theme. The results of this pattern are then presented based on this grouping as a sub-discussion in the article. Conclusions are drawn when the data truly represent the substance categorised and discussed by formulating the problem.

3. Conceptual framework

This study outlines several important theoretical foundations before fully discussing tolerance education's social construction to create a peace model. We divide it into two main themes. First, issues regarding Bali in a social context are interesting to study because Bali as a world tourism centre has made it the centre of attention for many people to visit Bali, thus creating a new social construction of assimilation between local wisdom and global modernity (Dunbar-Hall, 2001; Fagertun, 2017; Lorenzen & Roth, 2015; McKean, 2011; McTaggart, 1980). The touch of modernity, foreign culture, and cultural diversity have made Bali known as a region with high harmony of racial, ethnic, religious and cultural differences. However, all these differences do not seem to cause tension in relations between different entities, one of which is the relationship between Muslims and Balinese Hindus.

In the context of religious and ethnic differences, Bali has a long history of Muslim-Hindu-Balinese relations. Around the end of the 17th century, due to Dutch pressure to colonise Muslim areas in Lombok, Bugis Muslims migrated to Bali by sea route led by Syekh Haji Mukmin, a well-known and respected Bugis religious figure as *Puwak Matoa*. A group of Bugis Muslims arrived on Serangan Island, where at that time, the Badung region was controlled by King Cokorda Pemecutan III (Ardhana, 1993; Robinson, 1988). Because of the hospitality of the Bugis Muslims and their help during the Badung War, King Cokorda Pemecutan III received them well and awarded 2.5 hectares of land for the residence of the Bugis Muslim community (Creese, 2016). Good relations between Bugis Muslims and Hindus in Bali are very closely intertwined, and the creation of high tolerance and solidarity accompanies cultural acculturation. Until the Bali bombings in 2002 and 2005, which left deep wounds and exacerbated tensions in Hindu-Islamic relations, and eventually sparked negative sentiments towards Muslims in Bali and Islamic symbols (Tohari & Raya, 2021).

The relationship between Muslims and Balinese Hindus has also been revealed through several studies. Pedersen found an interesting sight in the East Bali region, where tolerance between Muslims and Balinese Hindus is strong. In the Hindu-majority area of Bali, Muslim women do not hesitate to wear the headscarf as a religious symbol while interacting with Balinese Hindus. The theory of "co-existence" is used by Pedersen to describe peace between Muslims and Hindus in the region in two ways: First, by active intergenerational negotiations in which religious leaders play the role of peacekeepers, and second, by economic dependence, which requires Muslims and Balinese Hindus to conduct business cooperation in the economic sector (Pedersen, 2014).

Muslim relations with other Balinese Hindus are manifested using interfaith marriages. Ida Bagus found the obfuscation of "Ajeg Bali" as a parameter that Hinduism is the official religion of Bali through marriages between local Balinese Hindus and non-Balinese Muslims in the Jembrana area, West Bali. This interfaith marriage sparked tension in the discussion of local identity citizenship, which was opposed by mixed marriages. This marriage also complicates the "hereditary caste" line, which religion monopolises as a substitute for ethnicity (Ida Bagus, 2008). In contrast to Ida Bagus, who departed from Balinese Hinduism as a turning point for the discussion, Nasir highlighted interfaith marriages from the Muslim side of Lombok, who perform interfaith marriages with Balinese Hindus. This interfaith marriage is a central factor in the discursive battle between religion, customs, and law as the locus of debate. This case uses a theory called "Institutional Authority", in which institutional authority is used as a basis for Indonesian citizens to resolve inter-religious tensions such as "elopement", which penetrates the legal boundaries of the two religions which strictly regulate interfaith marriages (Nasir, 2020).

Second, as a world cultural centre with various religions, Bali is interesting to study. In this context, it connects Balinese traditions or culture with religion in voicing tolerance education. The "*ngayah*" tradition is a means of communication for Balinese Hindus, which has promoted humanist values in religion. Balinese customary law is not perceived as a rigid and static normative rule but is open to cultural dialogue as a mediation of religion to society. With *ngayah*, people can get to know each other, build intimacy, be ethical in socialising, and communicate politely (Pitriani,

2020). The *menyama-braya* case in Banjar Angansari has proven that diversity in religion and culture has opened up spaces for respect for all differences between Muslims and Hindus in Bali (D. A. G. Agung et al., 2017).

Religion and culture are two things that cannot be put together, but both can be dialogued to form a harmony of peace in various ways. Basyir revealed that Balinese Islamic tradition is very synonymous with Hindu-based local culture. Like the *Manusa Yadnya* ceremony, it is called a birth ceremony in the Balinese tradition. In contrast, in Islam, *Manusa Yadnya* is manifested in the *neloni*, *tingkepan*, *selapanan*, or *babaran* ceremonies. Balinese culture seems to have greatly influenced Islamic practices, which are different from Arab and Middle Eastern cultures as the birthplace of Islam (Basyir, 2019). Likewise, with *kriya bebali*, one of the levels in the classification of Balinese craft which reflects religion as a culture and tradition that is "sacred, complete, and beautiful"; these three characteristics make an analogy of how religion is very open to Balinese cultural traditions (Sunarya & Sacco, 2021). Balinese culture and traditions can bridge religions to simultaneously build tolerance between religions (Eko & Putranto, 2019).

The form of Islamic and Hindu relations in Bali with religious and cultural acculturation in Bali has constructed a new tolerance education. This article tries to construct *menyama-brama* as a form of a combination of the two to find a model for peace-making through cultural diversity, religion and social education so that it can contribute to the ever-growing field of peace education.

4. Hindu-Muslims in Bali: Ethnoreligious existence

Bali is known as the "Hindu Island" due to the presence of Hindus, who are in the majority (83.5%) compared to Muslims. The figure of 13.3% of Muslim adherents is an ethnic group. The most dominant ethnic groups are the Sasak Muslims from Lombok and the Bugis Muslims from South Sulawesi. Based on data from the Central Bureau of Statistics for the Province of Bali, the Sasak Muslim ethnic group living in Bali is 16,430 people (0.52%), and the Bugis Muslim ethnic group is 6,596 people (0.21%) (Badan Pusat Statistik Provinsi Bali, 2015, p. 9). The Sasak Muslim ethnicity is spread in Karangasem, to be precise, in two Muslim villages, namely Nyuling village and Danginsema village, which are in Amlapura, East Bali. Their existence in these two places was due to the conquest of the Karangasem Bali Kingdom to the Lombok region, so many of the Sasak Muslim ethnicities migrated to Bali.

Meanwhile, the Bugis Muslim ethnic group is divided into several scattered areas, including Serangan Island, Tanjung Benoa, Kepaon village, Tuban, and Angantiga, far north Denpasar. The original territory of the Bugis Muslim ethnic group in Bali is on Serangan Island. However, due to the politics of the Hindu kingdoms in Bali, they had to spread as far as Angantiga (50 km from Serangan Island). As for other areas, for example, Pegayaman in Buleleng Regency is of mixed Muslim ethnicity, such as Muslims in Klungkung. Their existence is due to the spread of Islam from preachers from Mecca (Ako, 2021; Vickers, 1987), not ethnic Muslims like Sasak and Bugis.

In the contemporary era, the Sasak Muslim ethnicity in Nyuling village and Danginsema village have identified themselves as *"Orang Bali"* or "Balinese", because of their long history of migration being honoured by the King of Karangasem by giving a piece of land to be used as a "Kampung Muslim" or "Muslim Village" and making donations and facilities for those who wish to make a pilgrimage to Mecca. So many of their descendants were born in Bali. Regarding the locality dimension, the mention of *"Orang Bali"* or "Balinese" for the Sasak Muslim ethnicity in these two villages is appropriate. They simultaneously maintain their culture and language from generation to generation and maintain good relations for centuries with their neighbouring communities, namely Hindus. However, the *Balinese* also maintain their culture and principles as Sasak Muslims. As for the Bugis, Muslim ethnicities are fishermen and sailors who left their homeland (Makassar) due to Dutch colonial control of the region. Two incidents caused them to migrate to Bali. First, the Bongaya Agreement on 18 November 1667, which Sultan Hasanuddin signed as a delegate from the Sultanate of Gowa and Admiral Cornelis Speelman from the VOC. This was a peace treaty for the seizure of Makassar from the grip of the

Sultanate of Goa and Bone, which the VOC won. The five agreements detrimental to the Kingdom of Goa had to be signed by Sultan Hasanuddin to avoid causing many victims from the Kingdom of Goa (Feddersen, 2016). Second, in 1670, the Dutch East India Company or *Vereenigde Oostindische Compagnie* (VOC), controlled the Tosara fort in Wajo, which forced them to migrate to Bali.

Both the Sasak Muslim ethnicity and the Bugis Muslim ethnicity, the existence of these two ethnic groups in Bali are important to study. They still practice their culture and ethnic-religious principles and mingle with the traditions of the Hindu majority. Finally, being Balinese, being Sasak Muslim is a unique identity that we call *hybrid ethnicity or hybrid ethnoreligious*. At the same time, this finding is a differentiator from Amanda Fish's findings where hybrid peacebuilding efforts are applied to conflicting ethnicities (cases in Uighur-Han, Xinjiang-China) (Fish, 2022). This research also extrapolates important patterns from several cases of peacebuilding in Southeast Asia, bearing in mind that Muslims in Bali are apart from cases of ethnic-religious conflict such as those that occurred in the Uighur-Han, Xinjiang-China. Even so, the extrapolation that we have developed identifies how hybrid peacebuilding is obtained in a "naturalistic" manner without the intervention of current efforts.

Balinese are plural people who respect every difference and still maintain the uniqueness of each culture brought by certain ethnicities. This plural manifestation is through several religious symbols, for example, the symbol of worship of three different religions (Hinduism, Islam, Confucianism) in the Gambur Temple complex, Singaraja Bali. Still, in Singaraja, the Muslim community in Bali uses Balinese names as their first names, such as Nyoman, Ketut, Putu, Gede, Wayan, and others (Suprapto, 2015). Another symbol also appears in the Baiturrahman Mosque, Singaraja, which was built to provide a place for Hindus to hold traditional ceremonial processions.

When the Bali Bombings I and II occurred, the spectrum of *menyama-braya* was broken, and Hindus were very cynical towards Muslims. It intimidated them by blocking them from performing religious rituals, such as banning the call to prayer using loudspeakers (TOA) and prohibiting the opening of Muslim cemeteries and formal Islamic educational institutions. The pluralism that forms tolerance has disappeared, along with the tense relations between Hindus and Muslims in Bali.

5. *Menyama-braya* Ethnoreligious construction

Menyama-braya comes from two words, namely "nyama" and "braya". In Balinese customs, these two terms refer to a relationship based on a blood relationship (*nyama*), and a relationship that refers to a friendly relationship (*pasawitan* or *kanti*) (D. A. G. Agung et al., 2017). Balinese custom classifies these two terms very differently, especially in the inheritance with stronger laws than *braya*. I Nyoam Sujana said: "Nyama is synonymous with *pasidikaran* who *sembah kasembah*, *sumbah kasumbah*, *parid kaparid*, and *tegen kategen*". This *nyama* blood system is drawn from vertical lineages (*undagan nyama*) such as *bapa*, *pekak*, *kumpi*, *kelab*, *klambiyun*, *klepek*, and *kleweran*. And the horizontal lineage (*lingsehan nyama*) such as *misan*, *mindon*, *mindon ping pindo*, *mindon peng telu*. The merging of these two terms indicates a relationship meaning based on an immediate sense of brotherhood, both vertically, biologically and sociologically (Eko & Putranto, 2021).

Broadly, menyama-braya is manifested in religious rituals, such as funeral ceremonies (*ngaben* for Hindus and a series of Islamic funeral ceremonies), celebrations of religious holidays (*nyepi* for Hindus, as well as Eid al-Fitr and Eid al-Adha for Muslims), traditional clothing (*pecalang* for Hinduism, and *Busana Muslim* for Muslim). In economic activities, menyama-braya is manifested in vendor business, where Muslims are the business owners, Hindus are partners and workers, vice versa. The second form is the settlement of bad loans and interior design with the principle of *tat twam asi* where kinship deliberations and reduction of partitions in buildings allow for mutual respect and understanding of differences. Meanwhile, in education, menyama-braya is manifested in interactions between teachers and students, holding national religious events, ceremonial religious holidays in schools, and introducing cultural arts into subjects.

M*enyama-braya* is an interactional-integrative way of life that depends on the acculturation of all parties' traditions. Maliepaard writes that social integration in the case of Muslim minorities is currently a notable trend in which Muslim immigrants in non-Muslim majority countries create social networks for minorities and ethnic minorities. Religious differences are not a barrier to integration in urban social systems, and the two religions do not experience a decrease in the religious understanding of social integration (Maliepaard, 2012). The Copenhagen Declaration states that a society with solidarity is the main capital to tolerate and respect these differences without destroying good human relations (United Nations, 1995). Social equality is the right of every human being in social life.

The form of *menyama-braya* activity is not only in religious rituals but also in business and economic activities as Tohari and Raya found a phenomenon of *menyama-braya* in business activities in Denpasar, where 70% of vendors ranging from small micro businesses in the local market to medium-sized businesses are owned and managed by Muslims. In running their business, Muslims are assisted by their employees, who are recruited from non-Muslim circles to work as employees or business partners. Apart from trading, the Muslim minority also controls the business of producing chicken and beef cattle as the biggest suppliers in Denpasar. In some cases, Muslims are more agile and skilled in doing business, thus attracting the enthusiasm of Balinese Hindus to learn these business methods (Tohari & Raya, 2021). In the same case, *menyama-braya* is social capital for business strategy. Balinese, predominantly Hindu women are employed to make Banten, while Muslim business partners control Banten business activities from upstream to downstream (Saskara & Marhaeni, 2017). A business or company manages well, let alone uses a system of equalisation, because with a sense of brotherhood in doing business, feelings and hopes will be created in the same mind, discussing and filling each other for mutual harmony (Adnyani et al., 2019).

While in other cases, the concept of *menyama-braya* is used to settle bad debts and interior design. Bukti village, Kubutambahan District, Buleleng Regency, Bali The resolution of bad loans is overcome by *menyama-braya* where the community prioritises kinship deliberations and a direct approach to help minimise losses due to bad loans. The concept of *menyama-braya* in this case, is based on the principle of *tat twam asi* which means that the Hindu economy is based on the local wisdom of the region (Rasmayanti et al., 2018). In interior design, *menyama-braya* is applied to reduce building insulation, allowing the builders to see and communicate with each other (AA Istri et al., 2018). In essence, the concept of *menyama-braya* is a manifestation of unity which respects all differences with tolerance without destroying the social system.

As a social system, *menyama-braya* has been transformed into a pattern and habit of the Balinese, who emphasise individualism, social selfishness and blaming each other. *Menyama-braya* makes everyone work together and interacts with each other in religious and social activities regardless of racial and religious background. When *menyama-braya* becomes a social system, this tradition becomes a set of norms that must be followed by all levels of society so that there are consequences for those who do not comply.

Identically, *menyama-braya* is characterized by cooperation based on humanity. In Hinduism, *menyama-braya* is rooted in the philosophy of *Tat Tvam Asi* which means we; *Atmavat Sarva Bhutani* (everyone must position others as he positions himself) (Sternbach, 1957). Whereas in Islam, *menyama-braya* is rooted in the al-Qur'ān which gives an analogy that whoever kills a person is not for killing another person or for causing damage to the earth (such as committing an act of terrorism); it is as if he has killed all human beings in his life. Elements of life in the world; and whoever preserves human life, it is as if he has preserved the lives of all human beings (Surah al-Māidah: 32) (Tohari & Raya, 2021). Based on these two philosophies, *menyama-braya* crosses the transcendent boundaries of Hindu and Muslim communities in Bali.

The concept of *menyama-braya* comes from the Banjar Pakraman community, a Balinese Hindu community in Pakraman village. This community is formed on a high sense of cooperation towards each other despite their different religions. Various religious rituals are carried out with the help of Hindus and other residents of different religions. In the *ngaben*, tradition, Pakraman residents who follow the Hindu religion show solidarity when attending funerals (Bakan, 2011). Meanwhile, *subak* is a form of *menyama-braya* with the theme of farming with a strong sense of brotherhood (Yuliana, 2019). This tradition is transnational across regional, racial and religious boundaries. For example, Bugis Muslims follow the *subak* tradition with their Hindu counterparts.

6. The practice of *Menyama-braya* in religious rituals

In a pluralistic Balinese society, the manifestation of *menyama-braya* appears in social activities in religious rituals between the two religious groups. When we made observations, the first thing we saw in Kapoan village was the cremation ritual, a traditional Balinese Hindu funeral procession by cremating or burning the corpse at 760 to 1150 degrees Celsius to collect the ashes. *Ngaben* is not only a burning ritual. Other rituals accompany the corpse to the *setra* (a Balinese Hindu burial place). For example, preventive medical treatment for corpses, purification of *atma* or soul, and playing music with *gamelan beleganjur* before the body is cremated (Bakan, 2011). During the cremation process, Muslims accompany the corpse and carry the *bade* (a kind of coffin) to the *setra*. The participation of Bugis Muslims in accompanying the bodies of Hindus shows the most prominent form of tolerance, which can be seen when they encounter the practice of *menyama-braya* in Bali, even though Muslims perform rituals by Hindu traditions.

The second form is when Muslims in Serangan village participate in *ngayah* activities such as cleaning *pura* and other Hindu places of worship. Based on instructions from *bendesa pakraman* (traditional leader of the Balinese community), Bugis Muslims participate in *ngayah* without expecting any reward or appreciation (Pitriani, 2020). In this context, tolerance education is also realised by protecting places of worship. There are two symbolic buildings of the two religions on Serangan Island: the As-Syuhada Mosque and two temples (Sak Enan Temple and Sasuhunan Wadon Temple). The Balinese consider these three symbolic buildings as symbols of religious harmony. Moreover, the As-Syuhada Mosque is located not far from Sasuhunan Wadon Temple, about 200 meters away. At every religious ceremony, the two adherents of this religion help each other with all the preparations for the ceremony. The view that is usually seen is that adherents of these two religions take turns guarding places of worship if a Hindu ceremony is carried out by Muslims in Serangan guarding Sak Enan Temple and Sasuhunan Wadon Temple. Meanwhile, during religious events at the As-Syuhada Mosque, congregation members from Sak Enan Temple and Sasuhunan Wadon Temple volunteered to look after the mosque; occasionally, they also managed traffic and provided parking for mosque visitors.

During the *Nyepi* celebration, Muslims can carry out their usual activities and worship according to their religious beliefs. *Nyepi* is one of the celebrations of the Saka New Year's Day. Hindus are prohibited from doing social activities such as leaving the house, turning on the lights, holding parties, eating together, and working as usual. So that during *Nyepi*, many Bugis Muslim residents continue to trade and do other businesses, except for the office sector, which is indeed a national holiday by the government. Incidents like this occur in almost all areas of Bali, where tolerance becomes an education to the community about the importance of maintaining religious harmony.

The practice of *menyama-braya* in Bali is very visible when there is a death event. At the funeral ceremony, community cohesiveness is shown by preparing all the necessities of death, participating in the tomb's preparation, and carrying the corpse from the house to the cemetery. As in the village of Tuban, Bali, at the funeral procession for Abdul Hamid's father, Hindus and Muslims worked together to help prepare the funeral until the seven-day "slametan" event. When the body after being prayed for, Muslims and Hindus join hands to carry the body to the Muslim cemetery. Before departing, usually, the kyai or religious leaders ask all the residents present regarding their testimonies while the deceased is still alive:

"Ladies and gentlemen... The late Haji Sukri had been called by God Almighty. For the soul of the deceased to rest in peace with Him, we ask whether during the lifetime of a good person? People present both Muslims and Hindus replied: "Yes, we testify he is a good person". (observation, when Abdul Hamid's father died in 2018 ago)

While carrying the bodies, Muslims wear "taqwa clothes" or "Muslim clothes" and Hindus wear *pecalang* and other traditional Balinese clothes. When walking carrying the corpse of Muslims are on the left while Hindus are on the right. Mr Abdul Hamid said:

"Usually, when carrying the corpse, the right side is the heaviest than the left side, so Hindus carry the corpse from the right. This is done because Hindus feel grateful to Muslims for helping various Hindu religious ceremonies". (interview with Abdul Hamid, 20 January 2019).

When guarding each other's places of worship, they wear traditional Hindu clothing called *pecalang* (Suastika dkk. Suastika et al., 2020). This dress aims to create a sense of togetherness and unity and bridge the distance between religious and belief differences. Pecalang is symbolised by traditional cultural clothing in Bali, which Balinese security forces use in various religious and social activities (Astara, 2017). During the Islamic Holidays (PHBI – *Peringatan Hari Besar Islam*) Hindus also guard the Bugis Muslim mosque by wearing *pecalang* clothes, such as Eid al-Fitr, Eid al-Adha, and Isra' 'Mi'raj. *Pecalang* clothing used by Hindus and Muslims is in high solidarity with the existence of religious differences.

Based on the description above, it is evident that both groups have applied the principle of *menyama-braya*. The Bugis people who perform *ngayah* show adaptation from their conditions as those who live far from their homeland. That's where tolerance comes into play. This can be seen from their willingness to help make proper equipment in places of worship of different religions. However, they still do not pray in Hinduism. The Bugis community can give this form of solidarity by helping the Balinese Hindu society.

7. The practice of Menyama-braya in educational institutions

Citing MacAllister's statement that educational institutions are reproduced by society creates a new community to change how people view social interactions (MacAllister, 2016). The practice of *menyama-braya* results from people's awareness to create social stability, which is embodied through tradition and culture. The values of tolerance that have been "entrenched" directly affect human consciousness like their thoughts and actions. According to Alkazemi, the reality of religious tolerance seen by and enjoyed by a person can make him educated within himself (Alkazemi, 2019).

The tolerance practised by menyama-braya is ingrained in educational institutions. At SMAN 1 Denpasar, for example, when Hindu students perform a prayer ritual by chanting the Puja Trisanda prayer, their friends (Muslim students) will stand up as a form of respect. Likewise, when greeting Hindu teachers, Muslim students will say "OmSwastyastu", which means to say hello. Hopefully, those concerned are under the protection of Hyang Widhi. When there is a Muslim teacher, the Hindu students also say the greeting "Assalamualaikum". When we made observations, it was seen that Muslim female students wearing headscarves seemed to chat with Hindu students during breaks. They talk about things around the world and the lesson they just got from the teacher. SMAN 3 and SMAN 4 Denpasar are examples of senior high schools that accept students from all religions. These schools close on Friday at 12.00 so that Muslim students can carry out Friday prayers at the mosque, while on Sunday, these schools are closed to provide opportunities for students of other faiths to worship. In these schools, all Muslim students stand with their Hindu friends as they do the Trisandya Puja and Islamic prayers in class every morning before learning starts. At SMA Negeri 4 Denpasar, they allow Muslim students to celebrate Eid al-Fitr at their school and at SMPN 11 Denpasar, located on Serangan Island, they carry out Eid prayers on the school grounds.

The practice of menyama-braya was also exemplified at the MTQ (Musabaqah Tilawatil Qur'an) XXVII event held in Badung Regency, Bali, where several Hindus prepared the event preparations such as helping to decorate the stage, arranging chairs, and preparing accommodation. For the women, they ordered food and dishes for the guests and the contingent participants who came from all over Bali which consisted of 724 participants. In the event held on 11 May 2018, the Head of the Regional Office of the Province of Bali, I Nyoman Lastra said that this event aimed to echo the "Insan Qur'ani" and strengthen the "Soul of Menyama-braya" by displaying Islamic competition arts that breathe al-Qur'an. -Qur'ān and Balinese traditional art performances. There are seven types of competitions such as Recitation of the Qur'an for Adults and the Blind, Recitation of the Qur'an for Children and Teenagers, Quiz (Fahmil Qur'an), Hifdzil Qur'an (memorisation of the Qur'an) 1 juz, 10 juz, 20 juz, and 30 juz; Calligraphy, Khatil Qur'an, and the Balinese Cultural Arts Festival. In the philosophy of the Three Centers of Education initiated by Ki Hadjar Dewantara, educators and educational institutions strongly encourage the participation of parents and the community in learning that shapes students' character (Agus et al., 2020; Muthoifin, 2020) so that they can adjust to the concept of "independence" learning" with cultural values owned by the local area.

The practice of *menyama-braya* in institutions is a transformation of tolerance entrenched in the environment outside of school that occurs across generations. Parents carry out the practice of *menyama-braya* in the community. Their children do it at school because of imitating their parents in the environment. The spirit of fostering an attitude of tolerance begins in the family as primary education, where parents hang out with their colleagues from different religions. Like the *ngejot* tradition, the Balinese Hindu and Muslim communities give food to neighbours or relatives during school holidays. School holidays are meant during major holidays of the two religions. Hindu holidays are during Galungan, Nyepi, and Kuningan holidays, while Islamic holidays are usually ahead of Eid al-Fitr. Not only during religious holidays but this tradition is also carried out at *ngotonin* ceremonies or birthday events that invite the Muslim community to attend and participate in the celebration. Giving food and fruit to Muslims, or vice versa, is declaring that Muslims are their Hindu brothers and sisters. This *ngejot* tradition has been going on for a long time. Saihu assesses the *ngejot* tradition as an educational design based on local wisdom (Saihu, 2020).

Another form of *menyama-braya* shown in educational institutions is the introduction of *Rodat* Dance to all students. For example, at SMAN 4 Denpasar and SMAN 2 Denpasar, they performed a Rodat dance performance at the "Badung Cultural Festival". Rodat Dance manifests the close relationship between Bugis Muslims and Balinese Hindus that has lasted long since the Badung Kingdom in Puri Pamecutan (Ruastiti, 2019). This dance tells the story of the heroic Bugis Muslims fighting against the Mengwi Kingdom in the 1890s. Every time a ritual is carried out at Puri Pemecutan, this dance is shown to the public, symbolising the story of the defence of the Bugis Muslim community from the Hindu Badung community during the war. This dance still exists in Kepaon where the Bugi Muslim community performs it publicly. In this dance school, it is used as a cultural festival competition and in several textbooks on Cultural Arts.

During our observation, we found that the children at school used Bugis as their lingua franca. After cross-checking with their teachers, the students and teachers use three languages as the language of instruction in their interactions: Indonesian, Balinese, and Bugis. Using the Bugis language has been introduced by their parents as solidarity, which is embedded in the history of how Bugis Muslims defended the Badung people of Bali in past wars. This close relationship then creates a historical alliance, namely the relationship of heroism, the relationship between the king and the community, and the relationship between the community and the community. The result gives a unique colour of tolerance in Puri Pemecutan where there is a mosque inherited from the Badung Kingdom, built by the Muslim and Hindu communities as a symbol of the close relationship between these two religions.

Menyama-braya is not only in the form of a program but also in the composition of the teacher. At the State Elementary School (SDN) 2 Serangan, the school committee is held by a Muslim and the

committee representative is a Hindu. At this school, there was a parent community, "Arisan Ibu-Ibu", a gathering event for mothers and parents of students to have a relaxed, semi-official chat with an *arisan*. This community was formed because when mothers accompany their children to the playgroup (PAUD) park, which happens to be in the same scope as SDN 2 Serangan, they discuss various issues and topics while waiting for their children to play at school. Hospes said *arisan* is a form of informal finance developing in Indonesia, with its main function being socialising. Technically, all *arisan* participants pay a predetermined amount of money to the *arisan* committee, and at each meeting, the names of the participants are drawn in lots. Participants whose names appear in the lottery must be willing to serve as hosts and provide modest food or drinks (Hospes, 1992). In Java, the practice of arisan is usually accompanied by *pengajian* (recitation) and *kirim doa* (sending prayers) to the host's ancestors, followed by eating food and drink, as in the *slametan*.[3] During our observation, the arisan conducted by parents of Hindu-Muslim students was carried out without performing a prayer ritual. The women draw the arisan just like in Java, but after the drawing, the event is continued with *ramah tamah* or just chatting, eating food, and drinking.

8. *Menyama-braya*: Pioneer of peace education

Two concepts at the heart of *menyama-braya* are tolerance between religions and cultures and tolerance between kinship and friendship. Underlying the philosophy of *menyama-braya* is the concept of tolerance as a peace education campaigner. An interesting sight in 2019 where Muslim

Figure 1. Menyama-Braya Magazine (Vol. 7 issue, No. 2, June 2018).

students celebrated Eid al-Fitr at their school with all teachers and other Hindu, Buddhist and Christian students. Observing the school program at SMAN 4 Denpasar and SMAN 2 Denpasar, the Rodat Dance has been used as a venue for ethnoreligious performances between Balinese Hindus and Bugis Muslims since the era of the Badung Kingdom at Puri Pemecutan as a symbol of resistance against the Mengwi Kingdom. Due to the defence of Bugis Muslims for Balinese Hinduism, the Rodat Dance festival was included in textbooks in Balinese secondary schools.

A local magazine issued by the Regional Office (*Kanwil*) of the Ministry of Religion of the Province of Bali called "MENYAMA-BRAYA" with the subtitle "We are all brothers". In the 2018 edition, on the front cover, the Head of the Bali Provincial Office took a photo with five religious leaders in front of the World Peace Gong Park, Kertalangu-Ngurah Rai, with the tagline "spread peace". In the Vol. 7 No. 2 June 2018, Menyama-Braya magazine raised the headline "Bali Pioneer of Peace" to present peace narratives in music, Eid al-Fitr and Vesak celebrations with the Hindu Ministry of Religion employees, and the XXVII MTQ celebration (see Figure 1).

An investigation into peace education was carried out, and the findings indicated it was formed based on a tendency towards tolerance and human values (Tanyel & Kıralp, 2021). On the Main Report page, the big title "Bali Pioneers of Peace" is attached to explain the programs of Bali Province through the Ministry of Religion. The music, which was created and produced by three employees of the Bali Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion who are Hindus, was directed by Drs. H. Saefudin, M.Pd.I. as Head of Sub-Division for Law and Religious Harmony, who is a Muslim. The video clip involves all the chairpersons of the Religious Councils throughout the Province of Bali and interfaith youth as a concrete manifestation of creating peace. This video clip tells of an old grandmother holding the Red and White flag (Indonesian flag) crying because she sees youths of different religions arguing. This sadness was felt when he saw children from different religions distributing paper doves as a symbol of friendship. The old grandmother's happiness with a smile seeing this paper dove is a manifestation of the symbol of harmony, which is the title again, "Spread Peace". On Friday, 25 May 2018, at the Nirmal Denpasar Hotel, this song was officially launched at the Iftar and Consultation Meeting between Islamic Organization Leaders.

Menyama-braya magazine is a form of expression for people to portray something they want to achieve. Borrowing from Kitch's analysis, magazines are forums and platforms for expressing productive and organic social and cultural identities. *Magazines* are a new media landscape that controls big ideas from information through visualisation that appeals to the lower to upper–middle social class (Kitch, 2015). The community group is the Ministry of Religion of Bali Province and youth/I who support peace. The idea of a peace mission through its tagline, headlines, and magazine content reflects Menyama-braya's efforts to educate people to prioritise harmonisation between adherents of religions.

Then is this peace campaign an education? In Indonesia, education pathways are divided into three, namely formal, informal and non-formal education. This division is regulated in Law Number 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System in Article 13, paragraph 1, and Article 26. Informal education is a lifelong process of acquiring values, additional skills, and attitudes from daily life experiences in the environment (Rahabav & Souisa, 2021; Simac et al., 2021). The program in schools in Bali and the Regional Office of the Ministry of Religion for the Province of Bali is an attempt to emphasise embracing peace education campaigners. These efforts teach students and the public about human values regardless of racial, ethnic, and religious backgrounds. Potgieter et al. state that these values are formed from the deep religious understanding a person experiences based on the education he gains with experience (Potgieter et al., 2014). Experience in community life, which is a daily sight in Bali.

What is contained in article 13, paragraph 1, and article 26 is in line with Ohashi and Abid's findings that in Asia, the 21st-century trend is to equate non-formal with formal education. There are strong reasons underlying this, where the governments of Indonesia, the Philippines and Pakistan have developed

equality education for non-formal education. Many children dropping out of school is a serious global problem affecting these three countries. Efforts to equalise this educational pathway are to provide lifelong learning opportunities for marginalised groups (Ohashi & Abid, 2019). Even though peace education has been implemented in schools and within the community, it still obscures how inter-religious tolerance is carried out. Moorthy proposed integrating bioethics and values-based educational principles into the school curriculum to reduce social conflict and promote religious harmony. These two principles help reduce societal hatred and conflict by strengthening social cohesion (Moorthy, 2021).

Menyama-braya has taken root in the minds of the people so that this tradition has developed within the school environment, such as tolerance in reading prayers before starting lessons, the introduction of traditional Balinese dance into subjects, and the *ngejot* tradition, which is carried out outside of school but inspires into education in school. This concept was later approved by Nematollahi, who found that children with Phenylketonuria can quickly recover if their parents increase their spirituality (increasing faith, dhikr, being grateful, giving alms) and being tolerant towards fellow human beings (Nematollahi et al., 2021). Based on this analysis, *menyama-braya* tries to construct peace education by integrating tolerance, human values, bioethics, and values-based education. The educational ideas are based on the reciprocity between religion, culture, and society, as reflected in this model. All the elements of integration above play a role in contributing to peace.

9. *Menyama-braya* as a manifestation of tolerance

To get used to being tolerant, an entity must face an environmental condition in the area where they live. Borrowing Stabler's findings, the region becomes a potential place in the sociological context, whether it raises the seeds of conflict or creates an attitude of solidarity and tolerance (Stabler, 2019). The practice of menyama-*braya* integrates the principle of adaptation to the environment. Bali is an area that has a wide diversity of cultures and religious traditions. Warren, in his research, divides the concept of this adaptation into three: village, which means social environment or social setting; *kala* a timepiece; and *patra* a social situation (Warren, 1993). These three adaptations function as controllers so people can live harmoniously with religious diversity.

Desa and *patra* in *menyama-braya* make people who live nearby contribute to religious and social activities. It is common for Balinese people in a neighbouring village; they help with all their religious needs, such as ritual facilities and infrastructure, helping to secure conditions, and providing transportation and accommodation. Even though *menyama-braya* is taken from Balinese Hindu principles, cooperation is still carried out for shared social goals across ethnic religions. It is clear from the similarity of unity and tolerance in the practice of *menyama-braya*.

A sense of unity is formed because there is a sense of togetherness, an important element in forming an attitude of solidarity. As Platteau found, in the context of rural communities, they are more sensitive to their sense of solidarity than urban communities. The norms formed in rural communities have seeped into entrenched ways of thinking and acting (Platteau, 2006). This attitude of solidarity will be realised if members of a community group have the same views on social life. Nowicka's findings at least illustrate that today's solidarity has experienced a shift to what is called "transnational solidarity". This solidarity has embraced the tension of cosmopolitan and particularistic issues that divide the concentration of rural Muslim communities (Nowicka et al., 2019). Transnational solidarity results from socio-cultural and spatiotemporal interpretations of the norms that exist in society. That means the attitude of tolerance, manifested by solidarity from *menyama-braya*, results from the interpretation of the socio-cultural paradigm in the Bali region.

Tolerance taught in the *menyama-braya* tradition is education that consciously and structured society leads to respect for differences in beliefs and participating in solidarity in religious rituals and other social activities. However, this term was rejected by Shadi Nafisi, who stated that Islam does not adhere to absolute tolerance in every situation, leaving only certain spaces for several conditions. Islamic tolerance closes space for religious beliefs and beliefs, so for this matter, Islam

does not compromise. Meanwhile, Islam strongly defends the need for freedom of belief and expression in religion and suggests dialogue (Nafisi, 2018). Freedom of expression in religion is developed with the culture and traditions that develop in society. A *menyama-braya* tradition is a form of religious expression shown by the people in a certain area (Bali) which aims to educate people to tolerate each other amidst differences in religions and beliefs.

Menyama-braya is a tolerance manifestation emphasising ethnic-religious cooperation in every religious ritual activity and educational institution. This cooperation and *gotong royong* are then collectively realised by Balinese Hindus and Bugis Muslims as a culture inherent in society. Even though they have different religions, the desire of these two groups to live side by side peacefully has given birth to a concept of tolerance education embodied in the tradition of *menyama-braya*. This attitude also gives rise to education for the next generation to continue to care for and preserve the *menyama-braya* tradition as an important part of Balinese culture.

10. Conclusion

Menyama-braya is the basic value of local wisdom for the Balinese Hindu community with two Muslim ethnicities (Sasak and Bugis), which functions as a manifestation of peace education. *Menyama-braya* is manifested in the form of inter-ethnic-religious solidarity and tolerance. In the social context, *menyama-braya* was able to get rid of intolerance amid the onslaught of the "terrorist" stigma for adherents of Islam after the bloody tragedy of the Bali bombing. *Menyama-braya* can also eliminate the hedonic attitude in the middle of Bali as the centre of world tourism. Menyama-braya is a model for peace education to reconstruct division problems in a plural society. The combination of Balinese religion and culture becomes a unique pattern with a hybrid ethnic or *ethnoreligious hybrid*. This pattern explains how the two Muslim ethnicities became "Balinese" without abandoning their ethnic-religious principles (Sasak Muslims and Bugis Muslims) amidst the wave of the Balinese Hindu majority.

Menyama-braya is manifested in religious rituals such as cremation ceremonies and the independence day ceremonies of each religion. In educational institutions, *menyama-braya* is manifested in the reverence of the *Puja Trisanda* and *salam* (greetings), the involvement of Hindus in MTQ, the *ngejot* and *ngotonin* program, and the *Rodat dance* extracurricular. This manifestation is a naturalistic embodiment of peacebuilding by developing extrapolating peacebuilding in a hybrid ethnoreligious manner.

Author details
Moch. Khafidz Fuad Raya[1]
E-mail: hafidzraya@yahoo.co.id
ORCID ID: http://orcid.org/0000-0002-1934-2161
Vialinda Siswati[2]
ORCID ID: http://orcid.org/0000-0002-1477-0212
Akhmad Nurul Kawakip[3]
ORCID ID: http://orcid.org/0000-0003-4801-579X
Amin Tohari[4]
ORCID ID: http://orcid.org/0009-0007-0338-7449
Wawan Herry Setyawan[5]
ORCID ID: http://orcid.org/0000-0001-6612-0695
M. Mukhibat[6]
ORCID ID: http://orcid.org/0000-0003-0126-0210
[1] Center for the Study of Muslim Society, Indonesia.
[2] Institut Agama Islam Darullughah Wadda'wah, Indonesia.
[3] Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang, Indonesia.
[4] Department of Sociology, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, Sunan Ampel State Islamic University Surabaya, Surabaya, East Java, Indonesia.
[5] Universitas Islam Kadiri, Indonesia.
[6] Institut Agama Islam Negeri Ponorogo, Indonesia.

Notes
1. See Budijanto (2003, p. 216; 218). Previously, Islam in Indonesia was known as an inclusive and tolerant group (pp. 216), but the Bali Bombing dramatically changed its status to radical Islam (pp. 2018). Ramakrishna and Seng Tang said that Southeast Asia (especially Indonesia) is one-fifth of the world's total billion Muslims, and intolerant radical groups are the "second front" of terrorism targets (Ramakrishna &

cogent ••arts & humanities

Seng Tan, 2003, p. vii). However, Sebastian thinks radicalism and terrorism are apart from religious rhetoric. The statements of the perpetrators of the Bali Bombing (namely Amrozi, Imam Samudra, and their accomplices) have made it clear that their terrorist activities were motivated by hatred of the US and the West (Sebastian, 2003, p. 438). Likewise, based on the results of our research in Bali (Tohari & Raya, 2021), socially, Muslims as minority adherents in Bali face discrimination after the bombing incident (pp. 82). This sentiment led to the banning of Islamic symbols in public spaces, such as the ban on wearing face coverings for Muslim women (Hijab, Hijab and Niqâb) in government offices and malls, the expulsion of bearded Muslims and their wives wearing Niqâb, the prohibition of granting permission to build places of worship and Islamic schools such as *Madrasah Ibtidaiyah*, *Taman Kanak-Kanak Islam* (Islamic Kindergarten), and using loudspeakers for the call to prayer, and Muslim burial places (pp. 83).

2. Cremation ceremonies in Bali.
3. *Slametan* is a ritual to ask for "safety", carried out by preparing food and drink to be served (displayed in the ritual) during the prayer ritual involving men as participants in the prayer ritual and women in charge of cooking and preparing all food. In most cases, the *slametan* is given after sunset. The food consists of rice and side dishes such as chicken, beef or lamb, fish, eggs and vegetables without gravy, and fruits. In some rituals, such as death slametan, pregnancy, or the celebration of the birthday of the Prophet Muhammad. *Nasi tumpeng* or *nasi kuning* is almost obligatory food. In several places, such as Tengger, Central Java, and other areas where secrets are still present, the slametan usually decorated with *dupa* burning or *kemenyan* the ritual prayer. The Slametan has a fixed structure, and the prayers recited range between the Qur'an and common prayers read in the Muslim world. The prayer reading is led by a *modin, kyai, ustadz*, or someone considered a *sesepuh desa* (a village elder) with religious knowledge. See in (Van den Boogert, 2017, pp. 353–354).

References

AA Istri, N. N., I Gusti Ngurah, A., & Toddy, H. Y. (2018). *Implementasi Konsep Menyama Braya Pada Desain Interior Billionaire's Cut Barber & Coffeeshop*. http://Repo.Isi-Dps.Ac.Id/3646/1/Artikel%202.Pdf

Acharya, A. (2006). The Bali Bombings: Impact on Indonesia and Southeast Asia. *Center for Eurasian Policy Occasional Research Paper, Series II (Islamism in Southeast Asia)*, 2, 1–5.

Adhika, I. M. (2021). Reinvigorating cultural landscapes for planning cultural tourism in Bali. *Geojournal of Tourism and Geosites*, 33(4), 1462–1469. https://doi.org/10.30892/gtg.334spl03-594

Adnyani, N. K. S., Purnamawati, I. G. A., & Sulindawati, N. L. G. E. (2019). Internalization of Braya's amazing values as a management of business control in Endek Clothing UKM and Klungkung Songket (case study approach). *AKRUAL: Jurnal Akuntansi*, 10(2). https://doi.org/10.26740/jaj.v10n2.p145-156

Agung, D. A. G., Kanto, S., Wisadirana, D., & Ruja, I. N. (2017). Manyama Braya in Banjar Angansari, Bali in Foucault's genealogy perspective. *International Journal of Social Science Studies*, 5(8), 26. https://doi.org/10.11114/ijsss.v5i8.2484

Agus, C., Cahyanti, P. A. B., Widodo, B., Yulia, Y., & Rochmiyati, S. (2020). Cultural-based education of Tamansiswa as a locomotive of Indonesian education system. In Leal Filho, W., A. L. Salvia,

R. W. Pretorius, L. L. Brandli, E. Manolas, F. Alves, U. Azeiteiro, J. Rogers, C. Shiel, & A. Do Paco (Eds.), *Universities as living labs for sustainable development: Supporting the implementation of the sustainable development goals* (pp. 471–486). Springer International Publishing. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-15604-6_29

Ako, M. (2021). *Being Muslim-Balinese: The music and identity of the Sasak community in Eastern Bali*. National Museum of Ethnology. 増野亜子. https://doi.org/10.15021/00009765

Alkazemi, M. (2019). Inner peace or piece of mind? Religiosity, media exposure and tolerance for disagreement about religion. *Journal of Media & Religion*, 18(2), 39–49. https://doi.org/10.1080/15348423.2019.1651574

Ardhana, I. K. (1993). *Balinese puri in historical perspective: The role of Puri Satria and Puri Pamacutan in social and political changes in Badung*. https://doi.org/10.25911/5d7634a8da426

Astara, I. W. W. (2017). Public policy and role of traditional security officer (Pecalang) of religious tolerance in the traditional village Kuta-Bali. *Journal of Law, Policy and Globalization*, 67, 94.

Badan Pusat Statistik Provinsi Bali. (2015) . *Peta Sebaran Penduduk Menurut Suku Bangsa Provinsi Bali Hasil Sensus Penduduk 2000 dan 2010*. BPS Provinsi Bali.

Bakan, M. B. (2011). *Preventive care for the dead: Music, community, and the protection of souls in Balinese cremation ceremonies*. Oxford University Press. https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199756261.013.0011

Basyir, K. (2019). THE "Acculturative Islam" as a Type of home-grown Islamic Tradition: Religion and Local Culture in Bali. *Journal of Indonesian Islam*, 13(2), 326. https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2019.13.2.326-349

Brookes, G. (2014). *Terrorism, trauma and psychology: A multilevel victim perspective of the Bali Bombings*. (p. 192). https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315765136

Budijanto, B. (2003). Islam in Indonesia. *Transformation: An International Journal of Holistic Mission Studies*, 20(4), 216–219. https://doi.org/10.1177/026537880302000405

Creese, H. M. (2016). Bali in the early Nineteenth Century: The ethnographic accounts of pierre dubois. In *Bali in the early Nineteenth Century*. Brill. https://brill.com/view/title/32970

Dibia, I. W. (1985). Odalan of Hindu Bali: A religious festival, a social occasion, and a theatrical event. *Asian Theatre Journal*, 2(1), 61–65. https://doi.org/10.2307/1124507

Dunbar-Hall, P. (2001). Culture, tourism and cultural tourism: Boundaries and frontiers in performances of Balinese music and dance. *Journal of Intercultural Studies*, 22(2), 173–187. https://doi.org/10.1080/07256860120069594

Edgar, D., Wood, F., & Goodwin-Walters, A. (2005). Maintaining physical therapy standards in an emergency situation: Solutions after the Bali bombing disaster. *Burns*, 31(5), 555–557. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.burns.2005.01.018

Eko, B. S., & Putranto, H. (2019). The role of intercultural competence and local wisdom in building intercultural and inter-religious tolerance. *Journal of Intercultural Communication Research*, 48(4), 341–369. https://doi.org/10.1080/17475759.2019.1639535

Eko, B. S., & Putranto, H. (2021). Face negotiation strategy based on local wisdom and intercultural

competence to promote inter-ethnic conflict resolution: Case study of Balinuraga, Lampung. *Journal of Intercultural Communication Research, 50*(5), 506–540. https://doi.org/10.1080/17475759.2021.1898450

Fagertun, A. (2017). Labour in Paradise: Gender, class and social mobility in the informal tourism economy of Urban Bali, Indonesia. *The Journal of Development Studies, 53*(3), 331–345. https://doi.org/10.1080/00220388.2016.1184248

Feddersen, C. F. (2016). *Principled pragmatism: VOC Interaction with makassar 1637-68, and the nature of company diplomacy.* https://doi.org/10.23865/noasp.23

Fish, A. (2022). The applicability of hybrid peacebuilding in ethno-religious conflict: A case study of the Uighur-Han conflict in Xinjiang, China. *Asian International Studies Review, 23*(1), 53–86. https://doi.org/10.1163/2667078X-bja10012

Gurtner, Y. (2004). After the Bali Bombing-the long road to recovery. *Australian Journal of Emergency Management, The, 19*(4), 56.

Hefner, R. W. (2003). Hindu reform in an Islamizing Java: Pluralism and peril. In R. W. Hefner (Ed.), *Hinduism in modern Indonesia* (p. 93). Routledge.

Hospes, O. (1992). Evolving forms of Informal finance in an Indonesian Town. In *Informal Finance in low-income Countries.* Routledge.

Hutchison, E. (2010). Trauma and the politics of emotions: Constituting identity, security and community after the Bali bombing. *International Relations, 24*(1), 65–86. https://doi.org/10.1177/0047117809348712

Ida Bagus, M. (2008). Mixed marriages in Jembrana, Bali: Mediation and fragmentation of citizenship and identity in the Post-bomb(s) Bali World. *The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology, 9*(4), 346–362. https://doi.org/10.1080/14442210802493678

Kitch, C. (2015). Theory and methods of analysis: Models for understanding magazines. In *The Routledge handbook of magazine research* (pp. 9–21). Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315722283-2

Klemun, M., & Spring, U. (2016). *Expeditions as experiments: Practising observation and documentation.* Springer. https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-58106-8

Korstanje, M. (2011). Tourism, development, and terrorism in Bali. *E-Review of Tourism Research, 9*(2), 1–3.

Kruglanski, A. W. (2013). Psychological insights into Indonesian Islamic Terrorism: The what, the how and the why of violent extremism. *Asian Journal of Social Psychology, 16*(2), 112–116. https://doi.org/10.1111/ajsp.12019

Lewis, J. (2008). Recovery: Taming the Rwa Bhineda after the Bali Bombings. *Rethinking Insecurity, War and Violence: Beyond Savage Globalization?, Query date: 2020-10-23 16:37:29*, Article Query date: 2020-10-23 16:37:29. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203894194

Lorenzen, R., & Roth, D. (2015). Paradise contested: Culture, politics and changing land and water use in Bali. *The Asia Pacific Journal of Anthropology, 16*(2), 99–105. https://doi.org/10.1080/14442213.2015.1006667

MacAllister, J. (2016). What should Educational Institutions be for? *British Journal of Educational Studies, 64*(3), 375–391. https://doi.org/10.1080/00071005.2015.1131811

Maliepaard, M. (2012). *Religious trends and social integration: Muslim minorities in the Netherlands.* Utrecht University.

Mastika, I. K., & NIMRAN, U. (2020). Destination branding model of an ecological tourism village in Bali, Indonesia. *Geojournal of Tourism and Geosites, 31*(3), 1068–1074. https://doi.org/10.30892/gtg.31319-542

McKean, P. (2011). Tourism, culture change, and culture conservation in bali. *Changing Identities in Modern Southeast Asia, Query date: 2020-10-20 14:55:16*, Article Query date: 2020-10-20 14:55:16. https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110809930.237

McTaggart, W. (1980). Tourism and tradition in Bali. *World Development, 8*(5), 457–466. https://doi.org/10.1016/0305-750X(80)90077-7

Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2018). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook.* SAGE Publications.

Moorthy, R. (2021). Article sustainable societal peace through the integration of bioethics principles and value-based education. *Sustainability, 13*(6), 3266. https://doi.org/10.3390/su13063266

Muthoifin, N. (2020). Education and leadership in Indonesia: A trilogy concept in Islamic perspective. *Universal Journal of Educational Research, 8*(9), 4282–4286. https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2020.080954

Nafisi, S. (2018). Tolerance in Islam. *HTS: Theological Studies, 74*(3), 1–7. https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v74i3.5145

Nasir, M. A. (2020). Religion, law, and identity: Contending authorities on interfaith marriage in Lombok, Indonesia. *Islam and Christian–Muslim Relations, 31*(2), 131–150. https://doi.org/10.1080/09596410.2020.1773618

Nematollahi, M., Mehdipour-Rabori, R., & Bagheryan, B. (2021). Spirituality, a path to peace: The Experiences of parents who have children with Phenylketonuria. *Journal of Religion and Health, 60*(1), 374–388. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10943-019-00903-w

Nowicka, M., Krzyżowski, Ł., & Ohm, D. (2019). Transnational solidarity, the refugees and open societies in Europe. *Current Sociology, 67*(3), 383–400. https://doi.org/10.1177/0011392117737817

Ohashi, C., & Abid, A. H. (2019). Equivalent to formal education or rethinking education through a lens of non-formal education: Case studies of equivalency programs in Asia. In *Cross-bordering dynamics in education and lifelong learning* (pp. 30–47). Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429276460-3

Pamungkas, K., Sujatna, E. T. S., Darsono, H., & Haron, R. (2020). Geotourism branding through the names of tourism destinations in UNESCO global geopark Batur Bali: Morphological and toponymic studies. *Geojournal of Tourism and Geosites, 31*(3), 966–971. https://doi.org/10.30892/gtg.31305-528

Pedersen, L. (2014). 6 Keeping the peace: Interdependence and narratives of tolerance in Hindu-Muslim relationships in Eastern Bali. In *Between harmony and discrimination: Negotiating religious identities within majority-minority relationships in Bali and Lombok* (pp. 165–196). Brill. https://doi.org/10.1163/9789004271494_008

Picard, M. (2008). Balinese identity as tourist attraction: From 'cultural tourism' (Pariwisata Budaya) to 'Bali erect' (Ajeg Bali). *Tourist Studies, 8*(2), 155–173. https://doi.org/10.1177/1468797608099246

Picard, M. (2011). Balinese religion in search of recognition: From 'Agama Hindu Bali' to 'Agama Hindu' (1945-1965). *Bijdragen Tot de Taal-, Land- En Volkenkunde, 167*(4), 482–510. https://doi.org/10.1163/22134379-90003581

Pitriani, N. R. V. (2020). Tradisi "Ngayah" sebagai Wadah Komunikasi Masyarakat Hindu Perspektif Pendidikan Humanis-Religius. *Widya Duta: Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Agama dan Ilmu Sosial Budaya, 15*(2). https://doi.org/10.25078/wd.v15i2.1831

Platteau, J.-P. (2006). Chapter 12 Solidarity norms and Institutions in village societies: Static and dynamic considerations. In S.-C. Kolm & J. M. Ythier (Eds.), *Handbook of the economics of giving, altruism and reciprocity* (Vol. 1, pp. 819–886). Elsevier. https://doi.org/10.1016/S1574-0714(06)01012-8

Potgieter, F. J., Van der, W. J. L., & Wolhuter, C. C. (2014). Towards understanding (religious) (in)tolerance in education: Original research. *HTS: Theological Studies*, 70(3), 1–8. https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v70i3.1977

Rahabav, P., & Souisa, T. R. (2021). Evaluation of non-formal education management in Maluku Province, Indonesia. *International Journal of Evaluation & Research in Education (IJERE)*, 10(4), 1395–1408. https://doi.org/10.11591/ijere.v10i4.21116

Ramakrishna, K., & Seng Tan, S. (2003). *After Bali: The threat of terrorism in Southeast Asia*. Institute of Defence and Strategic Studies Nanyang Technological University and World Scientific Publishing Company. https://doi.org/10.1142/5438

Rasmayanti, N. M. D., Nyoman Trisna Herawati, S. E. A., & Anantawikrama Tungga Atmadja, S. E. (2018). Konsep Menyama Braya dalam Penyelesaian Kredit Macet di Lembaga Perkreditan Desa (Studi Kasus di Lembaga Perkreditan Desa, Desa Bukti, Kecamatan Kubutambahan, Kabupaten Buleleng). *JIMAT (Jurnal Ilmiah Mahasiswa Akuntansi) Undiksha*, 8(2). https://doi.org/10.23887/jimat.v8i2.13334

Raya, M. K. F. (2022). Wali Pitu in Bali: Inventing new halal tourism destinations in contemporary Indonesia. *Contemporary Islam*, 16(2–3), 475–505. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11562-022-00503-8

Robinson, G. (1988). State, society and political conflict in Bali, 1945-1946. *Indonesia*, 45, 1–48. https://doi.org/10.2307/3351174

Ruastiti, N. (2019). Deconstructing Ideologies behind Rodat dance in Kepaon Village, Bali, Indonesia in the global Era. *Asia Life Sciences*, 28(1), 17–29.

Saihu, M. (2020). Design of Islamic education based on local wisdom (An analysis of social learning theories in forming character through ngejot tradition in Bali). *International Journal of Advanced Science & Technology*, 29(6), 1278–1293.

Saskara, I. A. N., & Marhaeni, A. A. I. N. (2017). The role of social capital and business strategies in developing the business of Banten to Increase Balinese women's employment. *Journal of Comparative Asian Development*, 16(1), 68–86. https://doi.org/10.1080/15339114.2017.1292930

Sebastian, L. C. (2003). Indonesian state responses to September 11, the Bali bombings and the war in Iraq: Sowing the seeds for an accommodationist Islamic framework? *Cambridge Review of International Affairs*, 16(3), 429–446. https://doi.org/10.1080/0955757032000132353

Simac, J., Marcus, R., & Harper, C. (2021). Does non-formal education have lasting effects? *Compare: A Journal of Comparative & International Education*, 51(5), 706–724. https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2019.1669011

Stabler, S. D. (2019). Church, space, and pluralism: Two Puritan settlements, territory, and religious tolerance. *Sociology of Religion*, 80(2), 222–246. https://doi.org/10.1093/socrel/sry030

Sternbach, L. (1957). Cāṇakya's aphorisms in the Hitopadeśa (II). *Journal of the American Oriental Society*, 77(1), 26. https://doi.org/10.2307/594872

Stevens, G., Dunsmore, J. C., Agho, K. E., Taylor, M. R., Jones, A. L., & Raphael, B. (2013). Coping support factors among Australians affected by terrorism: 2002 Bali Bombing survivors speak. *Medical Journal of Australia*, 199(11), 772–775. https://doi.org/10.5694/mja13.10540

Stevens, G. J., Dunsmore, J. C., Agho, K. E., Taylor, M. R., Jones, A. L., Ritten, J. J. V., & Raphael, B. (2013). Long-term health and wellbeing of people affected by the 2002 Bali bombing. *Medical Journal of Australia*, 198(5), 273–277. https://doi.org/10.5694/mja12.11480

Suastika, I. N., Mangku, D. G. S., Yuliartini, N. P. R., & Lasmawan, W. (2020). The multi-Etnik community integration model in Bali: Pholosphical base and proto multiculturalism in Balinese society. *International Journal of Criminology and Sociology*, 9, 1226–1236. https://doi.org/10.6000/1929-4409.2020.09.142

Sunarya, I. K., & Sacco, P. L. (2021). Kriya Bebali in Bali: Its essence, symbolic, and aesthetic. *Cogent Social Sciences*, 7(1). https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2021.1882740

Sunesti, Y. (2014). The 2002 Bali Bombing and the new public sphere: The portrayal of terrorism in Indonesian online discussion forums. *Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies*, 52(1), 231–255. https://doi.org/10.14421/ajis.2014.521.231-255

Suprapto, S. (2015). Religious leaders and peace building: The role of Tuan Guru and Pedanda in conflict resolution in Lombok – Indonesia. *Al-Jami'ah: Journal of Islamic Studies*, 53(1). https://doi.org/10.14421/ajis.2015.531.225-250

Tanyel, S. S., & Kıralp, F. S. Ş. Tolerance for sustainable peace culture in a divided society: The effect of peace education on tolerance tendency and human values. (2021). *Social Indicators Research*, 156(1), 223–246. *Query date: 2021-08-07 05:22:40*. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11205-021-02630-w

Tohari, A., & Raya, M. K. F. (2021). The meaning of religious moderation on the resilience of Muslim Minority in Balinese Hindus. *Journal of Contemporary Islam and Muslim Societies*, 5(1), 77. https://doi.org/10.30821/jcims.v5i1.8686

United Nations. (1995) . *Copenhagen declaration on social development*. World Summit for Social Development.

Van den Boogert, J. (2017). The role of Slametan in the discourse on Javanese Islam. *Indonesia and the Malay World*, 45(133), 352–372. https://doi.org/10.1080/13639811.2017.1345166

Vickers, A. (1987). Hinduism and Islam in Indonesia: Bali and the Pasisir world. *Indonesia*, 44, 31–58. https://doi.org/10.2307/3351220

Warren, C. (1993). *Adat and Dinas: Balinese communities in the Indonesian state*. Oxford University Press. https://researchrepository.murdoch.edu.au/id/eprint/12304/

Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case study research: Design and methods*. SAGE.

Yuliana, E. D. (2019). Irrigation system implementation implications of renewable subak land on rice field in Bali. *Opcion*, 35, 1311–1331. (Query date: 2021-07-29 02:08:22).