



Trends of Religious Moderation Through Islamic Religious Education in Indonesian Universities: Systematic Literature Review

Benny Afwadzi

Correspondence:

afwadzi@pai.uin-malang.ac.id

Affiliation:

Department of Islamic Education,
Faculty of Tarbiyah and Teacher
Training, Universitas Islam Negeri
Maulana Malik Ibrahim Malang,
Indonesia

afwadzi@pai.uin-malang.ac.id

Abstract

Radicalism was a crucial problem in higher education institutions in Indonesia. To resolve this problem, the Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia introduced the terminology of religious moderation in 2019. This ministry also provided instructions for integrating religious moderation into universities' Islamic Religious Education (IRE). After, many studies emerged to examine its effectiveness in reducing radicalism. To synthesize and provide a comprehensive thematic analysis of previous studies, this research examined religious moderation in IRE in Indonesian universities using a systematic literature review method. This research discovered 20 primary literature related to the theme. This research found that the values of religious moderation tend to be tolerance or tasamuh and non-violence. Researchers' strategies and methods to develop religious moderation are varied, such as internalization, ISRA-based IRE, social learning models, and discussions. Meanwhile, the impact of cultivating religious moderation in IRE was able to shape students' moderate thoughts and attitudes while minimizing radicalism. This research proposed the role of religious moderation in IRE as a means of overcoming radicalism, intolerance, and religious violence in Indonesia. Besides, it allowed educators to articulate strategies and methods according to their capacities. Furthermore, IRE learning based on religious moderation in Indonesia became the best practice for other countries facing problems of radicalism, extremism, and terrorism.

Keywords:

religious moderation; Islamic education; university; radicalism

A. INTRODUCTION

Universities that aim to produce tolerant and inclusive students need assist with problems. One crucial issue is the spread of the seeds of radicalism in universities throughout the world (Achmad et al., 2023; Fautanu, 2022; Woelert et al., 2022). In Indonesia, radicalism among students began to develop after the New Order (Suharto's government) stepped down. In 2018, BNPT (National Counterterrorism Agency) detected seven universities affiliated with radical groups. After researching ten state universities (eight public universities and two Islamic universities), Setara Institut also found that formalist, exclusive, and conservative thoughts were widespread in the minds of university students. In 2020, research by PPIM (Center for the Study of Islam and Society) Jakarta showed that some students had a low level of tolerance (Afwadzi et al., 2023; Ali et al., 2021; Hully et al., 2023; Sirry, 2020). Based on these facts, studying radicalism in university has become an urgent and emergent topic. This study aims to emerge a solution to radicalism in universities, or at least minimize its movement.

The Ministry of Religious Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia (MoRA) voices religious moderation as a solution to the rise in acts of radicalism, extremism, and terrorism through a book entitled *Moderasi Beragama* (Religious Moderation), which was published in 2019 (Kementerian Agama RI, 2019). Religious moderation is also a solution to university radicalism,

which is infiltrated by radical movements and strengthens students' moderate thinking. Islamic Religious Education (IRE) integrated with religious moderation significantly reduces radicalism. Studies conducted by Burhanuddin & Ilmi (2022), Ma'arif et al. (2022), Nasir & Rijal (2021), Nabhani et al. (2023), and A. Anwar et al. (2023) demonstrate that reformulating IRE content with religious moderation in university can produce students who think moderately and tolerantly. In this context, the idea of religious moderation can fill students' cognition in order that it becomes a guide in thinking and behaving in their lives (Afwadzi & Miski, 2022; A. Aziz & Najmudin, 2020; Muhaemin et al., 2023).

Research on the interaction of religious moderation with IRE can be mapped into at least three trends. First is research that theoretically discusses the relationship between religious moderation and IRE. In this way, the contribution of religious moderation to IRE will be visible, namely, producing students with an inclusive and tolerant outlook (Masturin, 2023; Muaz & Ruswandi, 2022; Pajarianto et al., 2022). Second, research on instilling religious moderation in IRE with a focus on primary and secondary education. This second tendency results in inserting and internalizing religious moderation in the IRE curriculum and learning materials (MA Hasan & Huda, 2022; Huda et al., 2023; Nugroho & Nailufaz, 2022). Third, research on implementing religious moderation in IRE in higher education institutions. Most of the research in the third trend focuses more on IRE in public universities compared to Islamic universities. The researchers analyzed several IRE research objects based on religious moderation, such as internalization, development, and theoretical reviews (RN Anwar & Muhayati, 2021; Nabhani et al., 2023; Sodikin & Ma'arif, 2021).

This research examines the trend of religious moderation in IRE in universities using the systematic literature review (SLR) method in order that it is different from previous studies. This research aims to synthesize and offer a comprehensive thematic analysis of previous studies about religious moderation in IRE in Indonesian universities. The advantage of the SLR is oriented towards completeness, transparency, technical and implementation accountability, and eliminating research bias (Ahmad et al., 2020; Widiawati et al., 2022). This research also responds to the analysis of K. Hasan & Juhannis (2024), who state that the study of religious moderation and education is still relatively new and has yet to be widely discussed in the scientific literature. A complete depiction of this theme is an appropriate IRE policy tool in dealing with radicalism in higher education. Even though this study is similar to the third trend, these studies are separate, partial, and do not show one complete characteristic. Based on this reality, an in-depth review of the development of studies with the same theme is essential.

In analyzing this theme, the researcher has several research arguments. First, historically, teaching IRE material in educational institutions can experience changes as a dialectic between IRE content and the social context of society. Radicalism, as one of the social contexts of the university, has implications for improving IRE. IRE, integrated with religious moderation as an essential policy of the MoRA, is one of the improvements. According to Mulyana (2023), religious moderation can produce a safe and respectful educational institutional environment for Muslim and non-Muslim students. Second, functionally, IRE in university must produce students who have broad Islamic insight and are tolerant of others. This function is part of insan kamil, which is the goal of IRE (Sodikin & Ma'arif, 2021). Third, universities practically implement religious moderation in IRE in various models. Burhanuddin & Ilmi (2022) found that religious moderation practices in IRE are divided into several typologies. These various implementation models are essential data for determining the religious moderation policies in the next IRE.

B. METHODS

This research used a qualitative approach with a library research method. The data collection technique used a systematic literature review with the following steps (Ahmad et al., 2020; Widiawati et al., 2022). First, it determined the scope of the review, namely explicit criteria for determining the research direction. This paper's research object was religious moderation through IRE in universities. In the realm of university, religious moderation has

been integrated into IRE in various forms. Therefore, a comprehensive study was needed. As a solution to the radicalism that confronts higher education, educators have practiced and developed IRE based on religious moderation to realize it in concrete learning. Based on this statement, this study focused on three review questions (RQ), namely RQ1: What values of religious moderation can be developed in IRE in universities?; RQ2: What strategies and methods are used to develop religious moderation in IRE in universities?; and RQ3: What is the impact of religious moderation in IRE in universities for students?

Second was the literature search stage, which involved critical words to search for information. Search strings or keywords were arranged to obtain comprehensive results in this context. This research database was Google Scholar and Mendeley. The author used the following search string: "moderasi beragama" OR "religious moderation" AND "Pendidikan Agama Islam" OR "PAI" OR "Islamic religious education" AND "pendidikan tinggi" OR "universitas" OR "institut" OR "sekolah tinggi" OR "university." With this search string, the researcher obtained data on 4,410 pieces of literature. This large amount of initial data consists of several types of work, such as books, journal articles, proceedings, and final student research (undergraduate thesis, MA thesis, dissertation). The data presented by Google Scholar and Mendeley is still general, for example related to religious moderation only, religious moderation and IRE, religious moderation and university, IRE and university, and religious moderation, PAI, and university.

Third, the literature screening stage was carried out by filtering works outside the scope of the research. At this stage, the researcher used several criteria to embody the principles of inclusion and exclusion in SLR, namely 1) the literature must be relevant to the research theme, or in other words, must contain three items: religious moderation, IRE, and university; 2) literature must be published between 2019 as the beginning of the emergence of religious moderation until 2023 to examine the five-year impact; 3) the literature must be related to Indonesia as a place for the spread of religious moderation; 4) literature must be in the form of journal articles, conference proceedings, and research books to obtain primary references in religious moderation. After going through an in-depth review of the title and abstract with the assistance of the Publish or Perish (PoP) program, the researcher obtained 20 primary literature as primary data sources.

C. RESULT & DISCUSSION

1. Religious Moderation and Islamic Religious Education in Universities

Religious moderation is religious behavior in the middle path, neither radical nor liberal. Several studies demonstrate that its meaning refers to harmony, justice, tolerance, peace, and the middle way (Lubis et al., 2023; Zaduqisti et al., 2020). Furthermore, religious moderation refers to an understanding that emphasizes balance, tolerance, and adaptation in various situations based on religious guidance and social conditions (Helmy et al., 2021; Shihab, 2020). In this adaptation, Nasir & Rijal (2021) state that religious moderation presents inclusivism that respects other people's beliefs and rejects acts of violence in the name of religion. Daheri et al. (2023) state that religious moderation has three essential elements: upholding the principles of togetherness, accepting the reality of differences, and respecting each other. The researchers used four indicators of religious moderation as formulated by the MoRA: national commitment, tolerance, non-violence, and accommodating to local culture (Kementerian Agama RI, 2019; Rosidin et al., 2023).

Religious moderation can be implemented in education to create tolerant students. A A Aziz et al. (2021) mentioned three methods: inserting religious moderation in discussion material, learning approaches using critical and tolerant thinking, and holding religious moderation training. Integrating religious moderation in all learning materials is needed to improve students' moderate attitudes. Educators' understanding of religious moderation is also essential because they are students' role models (Latif et al., 2023; Muhaemin et al., 2023). Furthermore, in the era of digitalization of education, educators can contribute to developing religious moderation through digital library literacy, social media, webinars, and scientific

writing (Nyanasuryanadi et al., 2023). Meanwhile, Suwendi et al. (2023) propose three strengthening of religious moderation in educational institutions: respect for plurality to avoid conflict, internalization of the principles of justice, balance, and harmony in religious teachings, and integration of religious spirit and national commitment in learning.

Islamic Religious Education (IRE) is a collection of four study materials: Al-Qur'an and Hadith, Fiqh, Islamic Cultural History, and Aqeedah-Akhlaq. The IRE position is vital for forming good student character, which is influenced by the professionalism of educators (Tuna, 2022). The substance of IRE material speaks to broad learning content. IRE not only talks about the relationship with God (habl min Allah) but also the relationship with humans (habl min al-nas) and the relationship with nature (habl min al-alam). Thus, IRE provides balanced learning for students, both vertically (God) and horizontally (humans and nature) (Sakir, 2022). Suhayib & Ansyari (2023) and Saada (2023) stated that IRsE helps students to be able to contribute at the personal, local, national, and global levels according to their capacities while providing a peaceful and dialogical atmosphere of life.

IRE in Indonesian universities is manifested in various patterns and forms. At general universities, courses that study IRE are usually called Islamic Religious Education, and at Islamic universities, IRE is spread across various religious courses studied by students. Meanwhile, at universities affiliated with Nahdlatul Ulama (NU)—such as the Islamic University of Malang—for example, students study IRE through Agama Islam (AI) courses, which include Keaswajaan material which is characteristic of NU (Afwadzi et al., 2023; Fuad, 2019). At Muhammadiyah Universities, IRE is studied in the Al-Islam Kemuhammadiyahan (AIK) course (Afwadzi & Miski, 2022). Assa'idi (2021) said that IRE in Indonesian universities should not be antipathetic towards modernization in order that it can produce a young generation with an Islamic character. In Bosnia and Herzegovina, as Sijamhodžić-Nadarević (2023) mentioned, the formation of IRE aims to promote and support intercultural values through diversity, tolerance, solidarity, peace, and dialogue.

2. Results

Twenty articles met the criteria set by the researcher in the principles of inclusion and exclusion. After that, describing and mapping the 20 articles is an essential process. The goal is to build a descriptive map that systematically explains each activity in the review question (Ahmad et al., 2020). A more precise description can be observed in Table 1.

Table 1. Descriptive Map

No.	Authors	Year	Type	Topic	Approach	Location
1	Purwanto et al.	2019	Journal article	Internalization of religious moderation through IRE at public university	Qualitative (field)	UPI Bandung
2	A. Aziz & Najmudin	2020	Journal article	Forms of religious moderation in IRE teaching materials at public university	Qualitative (field)	STIE Perdana Putra Indonesia Tanggerang
3	Herlinawati	2020	Journal article	Integration of religious moderation in IRE at public university	Qualitative (field)	Several public universities in South Kalimantan
4	Thoriquttyas et al.	2020	Proceedings	Strengthening religious moderation in IRE at public university	Research and Development	State University of Malang
5	Sodikin & Ma'arif	2021	Journal article	Application of religious moderation in IRE learning at public	Qualitative (field)	Islamic University of Malang and Universitas

					university	Muhammadiyah Malang
6	Anwar Muhayati	& 2021	Journal article	Building religious moderation through IRE at a public university	Qualitative (field)	PGRI Madiun University
7	Sanusi & Fatah	2022	Proceedings	Mainstreaming religious moderation in the development of the IRE curriculum at Islamic university	Qualitative (field)	IAIN Kudus
8	S. Aziz & Ma'arif	2022	Proceedings	Islamic University's role in instilling religious moderation through IRE in society	Qualitative (library)	-
9	Hanafi et al.	2022	Book	Internalization of religious moderation in IRE at public university	Qualitative (library)	-
10	Muhja et al.	2022	Journal article	Implementation of religious moderation in IRE at public university	Qualitative (field)	University of Borneo Tarakan
11	Muzaqi et al.	2022	Journal article	IRE learning to improve religious moderation in university	Quantitative	Universities in East Java (not named)
12	Ma'arif et al.	2022	Journal article	Moderate IRE learning strategy at Islamic university	Qualitative (field)	Islamic University of Malang
13	Hefni & Ahmadi	2022	Journal article	Collaboration between Islamic university and extension workers in spreading IRE based on religious moderation	Qualitative (library)	UIN Kiai Haji Achmad Siddiq Jember
14	Suyudi & Putra	2022	Journal article	Implementation of IRE is based on religious moderation at Islamic university	Qualitative (field)	IAIN Ponorogo
15	Hully et al.	2023	Journal article	Internalization of religious moderation in IRE at university	Qualitative (field)	Universities in Indonesia (not mentioning names)
16	Mutmainah et al.	2023	Journal article	IRE strategy to increase religious moderation at Islamic university	Qualitative (field)	STAI Syaichona Moh. Cholil Bangkalan
17	Rahman et al.	2023	Journal article	Development of religious moderation in IRE material at public university	Qualitative (field)	State University of Banjarmasin
18	Fadholi et al.	2023	Journal	Strengthening	Qualitative	IAIN Madura

				article	religious moderation in IRE at Islamic university	(field)	
19	Rahmat Khoiriyyah	&	2023	Journal article	Religious moderation in IRE at university	Qualitative (library)	-
20	Nabhani et al.		2023	Journal article	Implementation of religious moderation in IRE at public university	Qualitative (field)	Several public universities in East Priangan

The following are detailed answers to the three review questions in this study. The author limits ten pieces of literature for each review question in order that it can be understood well. The ten pieces of literature are taken from research with the highest significance for the review question. In addition, this limitation prevents the repetition of the same ideas in different literature.

RQ1: What values of religious moderation can be developed in IRE in universities?

Table 2. Map of Religious Moderation Values

No.	Authors and Year	Findings	Orientation
1.	(Herlinawati, 2020)	Tolerance, brotherhood (<i>ukhuwah</i>), and religion as <i>rahmatan li al-'alamin</i> .	Tolerance and non-violence
2.	(Thoriquttyas et al., 2020)	Nationalism	National commitment
3	(Sodikin & Ma'arif, 2021)	Tolerance (<i>tasamuh</i>), <i>tajdid</i> , <i>tajrid</i> , <i>al-tawasuth</i> , <i>al-muhadapah</i> , <i>al-tawazun</i> , <i>al-i'tidal</i> , <i>musyarakah</i> , harmony, togetherness, honesty and discipline, and <i>al-muhafazhat 'ala al-qadim al-shalih wa al-akhdzu bi al-jadid al-ashlah</i>	National commitment, tolerance, non-violence, and accommodating to local culture
4.	(Hanafi et al., 2022)	<i>Tawassuth</i> , <i>i'tidal</i> , <i>tasamuh</i> , deliberation, <i>ishlah</i> , <i>qudwah</i> , <i>muwathanah</i> , <i>al-la 'unf</i> , and <i>i'tiraf bil 'urf</i>	National commitment, tolerance, non-violence, and accommodating to local culture
5	(Muhja et al., 2022)	Tolerance, love for others, love for the homeland, patriotism, and defending the country	National commitment, tolerance, and non-violence
6	(Hefni & Ahmadi, 2022)	Tolerance, balance, humanism, egalitarianism and justice	Tolerance and non-violence
7	(Rahman et al., 2023)	<i>I'tidal</i> and <i>tasamuh</i>	Tolerance
8	(Hully et al., 2023)	<i>Tawassuth</i> , <i>tasamuh</i> , <i>tawazun</i> , <i>i'tidal</i> , <i>'adl</i> , <i>shura</i> , <i>islah</i> , <i>qudwah</i> , and recognize Pancasila as the basis of the state (<i>muwathanah</i>)	National commitment, tolerance, and non-violence.
9	(Rahmat & Khoiriyyah, 2023)	Humanist, anti-violence and anti-bullying	Tolerance and Non-violence
10	(Mutmainah et al., 2023)	Solidarity, tolerance, respect and love for other people who are different	Tolerance and non-violence

Table 2 illustrates that each article has a different orientation towards religious moderation values. In this context, the researcher made their orientation based on four indicators of religious moderation: national commitment, tolerance, non-violence, and accommodation of local culture. The orientation of tolerance and non-violence is most

frequently mentioned in articles discussing the value of religious moderation. Almost all writings mention tolerance or tasamuh and non-violence as values of religious moderation. The data also explains that two articles have a complete orientation towards indicators of religious moderation, namely research of Sodikin & Ma'arif (2021) and Hanafi et al. (2022), which is quite comprehensive. Other values, such as humanism, egalitarianism, and tajdid, are not included in the moderate indicator category, which is essential in spreading religious moderation in universities.

The values of religious moderation occupy an essential position in the discourse on religious moderation because they offer a more transparent form of understanding. Researchers who focus on tolerance, Rahman et al. (2023) found that the values of i'tidal and tasamuh are values of religious moderation developed in IRE. Research on religious material found that these values affect students' correct religious understanding. They can also implement the concept broadly and flexibly in various aspects of their lives. Other researchers, such as Herlinawati (2020), Hefni & Ahmadi (2022), Rahmat & Khoiriyah (2023), and Mutmainah et al. (2023) also linked to anti-violence. To see the application of anti-violence education in public universities, Herlinawati (2020) stated that tolerance, brotherhood (ukhuwah), and religion as rahmatan li al-'alamin are values of religious moderation. Meanwhile, Rahmat & Khoiriyah (2023) propose humanism, anti-violence, and anti-bullying, and Mutmainah et al. (2023) propose solidarity, tolerance, and respecting and loving other people who are different in a plural community. Both of them hope that the values of religious moderation can be integrated into IRE. The values offered by Hefni & Ahmadi (2022), tolerance, balance, humanism, egalitarianism, and justice, are the values at their university, which Islamic religious instructors spread.

Apart from that, understanding national commitment is also a reference for the values of religious moderation. Thoriquttyas et al. (2020) focus on nationalism due to the emergence of an exclusive religious understanding that is rigid and dry of touch with national values. Muhja et al. (2022) believe that tolerance, love for others, love of the homeland, patriotism, and defending the country must be included in IRE to prevent radical behavior in Indonesia. This radicalism disrupts the stability of national and state life. For Hully et al., (2023), the values of religious moderation, such as tawassuth, tasamuh, tawazun, i'tidal, 'adl, shura, islah, qudwah, and muwathanah must be internalized in IRE learning. They found these values were at the value transformation stage or cognitive area.

More broadly, Sodikin & Ma'arif (2021) view that the values developed in IRE are in a broad area. These values are tolerance (tasamuh), tajdid, tajrid, al-tawasuth, al-muwajahah, al-tawazun, al-i'tidal, musyarakah, harmony, togetherness, honesty and discipline, and al-muhafazhat 'ala al-qadim al-shalih wa al-akhdzu bi al-jadid al-ashlah. They found it from studying at NU and Muhammadiyah universities. In line with that, Hanafi et al. (2022) emphasized the nine values of religious moderation: tawassuth, i'tidal, tasamuh, deliberation, islah, qudwah, muwathanah, al-la 'unf, and i'tiraf bil 'urf, can be internalized in IRE learning. These nine values are provisions of the MoRA.

RQ2: What strategies and methods are used to develop religious moderation in IRE in universities?

Table 3. Strategy Map and Methods for the Development of Religious Moderation

No.	Author and Year	Findings	Orientation
1.	(Purwanto et al., 2019)	Internalization of religious moderation values in IRE	Learning
2.	(A. Aziz & Najmudin, 2020)	Use of IRE textbooks with moderate insight	Learning
3.	(Thoriquttyas et al., 2020)	Civic Intelligence and the Values Clarification Technique (VCT)	Learning
4.	(RN Anwar & Muhayati, 2021)	Understanding Islamic study methodology, a substance in the IRE curriculum with moderate nuances, discussion space, BBQ (Qur'an Reading Guidance) program,	Learning, facilities, and educational support units

		exemplary and moderate attitude from lecturers, assistance with student activity units, and program evaluation.	
5.	(Ma`arif et al., 2022)	IRE learning is based on religious moderation	Learning
6.	(Muzaqi et al., 2022)	IRE learning based on ISRA (<i>Islam rahmatan lil alamin</i>)	Learning
7.	(Rahmat & Khoiriyah, 2023)	Direct learning (drill), indirect learning strategies (relaxation); multidisciplinary approach, inquiry methods, discussion and question and answer techniques, and religious and Indonesian-based learning objectives	Learning
8.	(Mutmainah et al., 2023)	Social learning model	Learning
9	(Fadholi et al., 2023)	Discussion in IRE learning	Learning
10	(Hully et al., 2023)	Internalization of religious moderation values through IRE	Learning

Table 3 indicates that religious moderation in IRE is developed using various strategies and methods. The majority of studies direct development towards learning orientation. This phenomenon can be understood because IRE is a course students in tertiary institutions study. Thus, like it or not, the development direction is in the learning aspect. Despite this, studies carried out by RN Anwar & Muhayati (2021) demonstrate that the development of religious moderation in IRE is not only in learning but also takes the role of educational support facilities and units, such as the BBQ (Qur'an Reading Guidance) program and mentoring carried out by student activity units. For them, building an attitude of religious moderation means respecting diversity and forming collective community awareness.

Developing religious moderation in IRE in university requires strategies and methods to realize it well. In this context, researchers propose strategies and methods that are considered accurate. For example, Rahmat & Khoiriyah (2023) use specific strategies and models. They propose direct learning through drills and indirect learning with relaxation. Meanwhile, the learning model employs a multidisciplinary approach, inquiry methods, discussion and question and answer techniques, and religious and Indonesian-based learning objectives. Ma'arif et al. (2022) propose a learning strategy based on religious moderation to strengthen students' affective and psychomotor side. This strategy can be applied in various learning strategies, such as experiential, habitual, emotional, functional, and rational. Educators can also use various learning methods, such as lectures, discussions, experiments, and assignments, but maintain moderate values and rahmatan lil 'alamin. For A. Aziz & Najmudin (2020), religious moderation can be instilled in IRE by making books containing the values of religious moderation as reference teaching materials. Even though a reference does not mention the term, the critical fact is that its content directs the values of religious moderation.

Other researchers, such as Mutmainah et al. (2023), call the IRE learning strategy a social learning model that is proven to increase religious moderation through programmed imitation and independent imitation. Programmed imitation includes learning Islamic education courses, training, seminars, and studies. Meanwhile, independent imitation includes learning together (Peer Group), increasing direct observation, and independent practice and habituation. Muzaqi et al. (2022) also proposed IRE learning based on ISRA (*Islam rahmatan lil 'alamin*) to improve religious moderation. He said that the ISRA model was quite effective in implementing religious moderation in order that students' moderate attitudes could increase. Meanwhile, according to Fadholi et al. (2023), discussion in IRE learning is a method that is quite successful. Through this method, students must talk and analyze study material to gather ideas, create their perspectives, and develop several issue-solving options on a particular topic. Thoriquuttyas et al. (2020) use the Values Clarification Technique (VCT) learning model to strengthen religious moderation.

The internalization method has also attracted the attention of several existing literature. Purwanto et al. (2019) stated that the internalization of religious moderation in IRE was done using several patterns. These patterns revolve around several stages: material adapted to student input, attention to the competence of the lecturers who teach, and support from universities. The internalization method is conducted face-to-face in lectures, tutorials, seminars, etc. Meanwhile, evaluation is carried out through verbal and written Islamic insight screening. Meanwhile, Hully et al. (2023) mention several internalizations of religious moderation values through IRE, namely transformation (cognitive), transaction (affective), and trans-internalization (psychomotor). Transformation is the initial stage, where students are taught and introduced to the importance of religious moderation values. This introduction is through teaching or lecturing in class using various interactions and methods, such as lectures and others. The transaction is a stage of values education (forming and instilling moderate Islamic values) through direct reciprocal relationships and two-way communication between lecturers and students. Trans-internalization is the stage of application and self-actualization or practice, where the values that have been embraced, owned, and adhered to have been integrated into students in order that they have a complete personality.

RQ3: What is the impact of religious moderation in IRE in universities for students?

Table 4. Map of the Impact of Religious Moderation

No.	Author and Year	Findings	Orientation
1.	(Purwanto et al., 2019)	Bringing up a moderate attitude in students and minimizing radicalism	Positive-qualitative
2.	(Thoriquttyas et al., 2020)	The scale of religious moderation can be increased through the involvement of civic intelligence techniques and clarification of values to strengthen religious moderation.	Positive-quantitative
3.	(Sodikin & Ma'arif, 2021)	The Aswaja creed was ingrained in students, eliminating radical organizations in universities, and the niqab was banned.	Positive-qualitative
4.	(RN Anwar & Muhayati, 2021)	Able to build students' attitudes of religious moderation	Positive-qualitative
5.	(Rahmat & Khoiriyah, 2023)	Fostering religious moderation in educational institutions	Positive-qualitative
6.	(Muzaqi et al., 2022)	Quite effective in improving students' moderate attitudes	Positive-quantitative
7.	(Mutmainah et al., 2023)	Able to increase students' understanding and awareness of religious moderation	Positive-qualitative
8.	(Fadholi et al., 2023)	Creating harmony within religions even though students have different points of view	Positive-qualitative
9.	(Hully et al., 2023)	Can build moderate character in college	Positive-qualitative
10.	(Rahman et al., 2023)	Able to construct students' correct religious understanding and implement it in everyday life	Positive-qualitative

Table 3 shows the positive impact of instilling religious moderation—with various strategies and methods—in IRE in university. This positive impact can be measured qualitatively or quantitatively. Thus, religious moderation in IRE is essential in strengthening students' moderate thoughts and attitudes and minimizing radicalism in the university environment. The researchers do not hold a skeptical view of the religious moderation policy promoted by the MoRA. They realize that radicalism, extremism, and terrorism are vital problems for the Indonesian nation today. In this context, religious moderation functions to solve this issue.

3. Discussion

This research found several significant findings. First, the values of religious moderation developed in IRE vary greatly. In this case, the researcher found a tendency towards tolerance or tasamuh and non-violence—two very related indicators—in the values proposed by the researchers. Apart from that, some values are outside the four moderate indicators that are significant in the development of religious moderation, namely humanism, egalitarianism and tajdid (renewal); and universal values of moderation such as tawassuth, tasamuh, tawazun, and i'tidal. Second, the strategies and methods used by researchers to develop religious moderation are also quite varied, such as internalization, ISRA-based IRE, social learning models, and discussions. Third, the impact of instilling religious moderation in IRE is that it can shape students' moderate thoughts and attitudes while minimizing radicalism.

The author understands the results of this study in three points. First, the findings highlight that the values of religious moderation are not only limited to the scope of moderate indicators but also include other values, such as humanism, egalitarianism, and tajdid. The author emphasize these variations in values as a development of religious moderation, which helps to detail a more complex framework of values. However, the tendency towards tolerance and non-violence means that religious moderation is synonymous with religious tolerance. Second, various strategies and methods reflect the diversity of approaches in building religious moderation in university. This diversity indicates flexibility in using pedagogical approaches to achieve moderation goals. Third, the change in students' thoughts and attitudes towards moderation as a result of instilling religious moderation in IRE proves the effectiveness of this learning model in minimizing radicalism.

This research has significant implications that religious moderation in IRE can overcome or at least minimize the phenomenon of radicalism that often occurs among students. Although many research organizations such as BNPT, Setara Institute, and PPIM have found the issue of radicalism among students (Ali et al., 2021; Sirry, 2020), religious moderation in IRE will offer a solution to this issue, as shown by the results of this study. Furthermore, the finding that tolerance and non-violence are the values most frequently proposed by researchers is essential to overcoming the widespread religious intolerance and violence in Indonesia (Ikhrom et al., 2023; Saputra et al., 2023). Several cases of intra-religious intolerance and violence, such as the Sunni and Shia conflicts in Sampang Madura and Bangil Pasuruan, as well as inter-religious conflicts, such as the Ambon and Poso conflicts, have occurred in Indonesia (Isya, 2018; Rokhmad, 2019). Indonesia is a country that has religious and cultural plurality, so it needs binding elements in order that it is not separated. In this context, tolerance and non-violence are essential in resolving these conflicts.

In addition, the varied strategies and methods for cultivating religious moderation in IRE have implications for Islamic education policy in Indonesia. Islamic education must consider more excellent space for diverse approaches adapted to the conditions of universities, students, and lecturers. In this context, lecturers can articulate strategies and methods according to their capacities. This guideline can assist universities in designing Islamic education based on effective moderation. The findings of the effectiveness of the religious moderation learning model in IRE encourage Islamic education to emphasize elements of religious moderation in curriculum formation. According to Hasanah & Faddad SZ (2023), universities in Indonesia and Malaysia must prioritize moderate religious values to face the Megatrend 2045. Thus, Islamic education becomes an effective tool in reducing radicalism.

This research indicates that Indonesia has a trend in developing a moderate understanding of IRE learning. In other countries that tend to be secular, such as Singapore and Türkiye, as mentioned by Bagas Mukti Nasrowi (2021), the planting of moderate Islam was carried out through coercion in order that it seemed frontal and firm. The strategy to create a moderate Muslim society is actualized by controlling educational institutions, especially Islamic educational institutions, both formal (schools and universities) and non-formal educational institutions (such as Friday sermons, religious lectures, books, magazines, and so on). Furthermore, the learning model practiced in Indonesia can also be a role model for IRE learning in other countries that still need improvements, especially in tackling terrorism and

radicalism, such as Belgium (Franken, 2018) and France (Girin, 2021). As the largest Muslim country in the world, IRE learning based on religious moderation in Indonesia can become the best practice for other countries facing problems of radicalism, extremism, and terrorism.

However, religious moderation in IRE in Indonesia has a fundamental weakness, namely the negative perception of some Indonesian citizens towards religious moderation. They view that religious moderation is a MoRA project that has political and ideological goals. They also assume that religious moderation is an Islamic ideology that is not serious and does not practice religious teachings wholeheartedly (Afwadzi, 2022; Jafar, 2018; Kementerian Agama RI, 2019). This view is a fundamental thought that has an impact on other aspects. If, from the start, society has had a negative view of religious moderation, then developing moderation in any strategy and method will be difficult for students to accept. Joint efforts are needed to remove this negative view from society.

Several actions are needed as recommendations from the results of this study. First, revise the IRE curriculum to include more comprehensive religious moderation values and organize regular training for university educators in implementing religious moderation teaching strategies (Sanusi & Fatah, 2022). Second, encourage collaboration between educational institutions to share best practices and research results related to religious moderation and facilitate the exchange of experiences to increase the effectiveness of religious education programs. Third, activate discussion forums and workshops between stakeholders, including educators, parents, and students, to build a shared understanding of the importance of religious moderation and support the implementation of these values outside the university.

D. CONCLUSION

IRE learning, sometimes considered too normative because it only prioritizes traditional approaches, has great potential in overcoming radicalism. This great potential can only be realized by including religious moderation in IRE learning. With 20 primary sources of literature, the findings of this study demonstrate that the values of religious moderation that researchers popularly use are tolerance and non-violence. This fact indicates that religious moderation is often understood as religious tolerance. In addition, the diversity of strategies and methods used to develop religious moderation in IRE, such as internalization, ISRA-based IRE, social learning models, and discussions, informs flexibility in using pedagogical approaches to achieve moderation goals. These various strategies and methods have an impact on overcoming radicalism among students.

Religious moderation, which is synonymous with religious tolerance, as evidenced by the tendency for religious moderation values in the form of tolerance or tasamuh and non-violence, has implications for the role of religious moderation as a means of overcoming religious intolerance and violence, which often occurs in Indonesia. Educators must maximize the instilling of religious moderation values to achieve this goal. Educators should also be given the freedom to articulate strategies and methods according to their capacities. This guideline can assist universities in designing Islamic education based on effective moderation. This role will assist solve the main issue, radicalism, spreading among students.

The weakness of this study is that it only focuses on examining religious moderation in IRE in Indonesia. Other countries have their models and ways of developing moderate understanding among students. The social context and thoughts of the actors who develop moderation in other countries differ from those in Indonesia. Therefore, studies of religious moderation in IRE in many countries are needed to offer comprehensive information. In addition, this study only focuses on three aspects, namely values, development strategies and methods, and the impact of religious moderation in IRE. Future researchers can examine other aspects, such as indicators of religious moderation and religious moderation practices outside formal educational institutions.

REFERENCES

Achmad, N., Harahap, R. H., & Ihsan, M. I. (2023). Radicalism movement in higher education in

Indonesia: Students' understanding and its prevention. *Kasetsart Journal of Social Sciences*, 44(1), 123–128. <https://doi.org/10.34044/j.kjss.2023.44.1.13>

Afwadzi, B. (2022). Resepsi atas Islam Moderat: Antara Kritik dan Sikap yang Representatif. *NUANSA: Jurnal Penelitian Ilmu Sosial Dan Keagamaan Islam*, 19(2), 182–208. <https://doi.org/10.19105/nuansa.v19i2.6687>

Afwadzi, B., & Miski, M. (2022). Islam Moderat di Perguruan Tinggi Muhammadiyah: Interpretasi dan Penerimaan Mahasiswa. *Cakrawala: Jurnal Studi Islam*, 17(2), 59–80. <https://doi.org/10.31603/cakrawala.8014>

Afwadzi, B., Miski, M., Aulia, M., & Jannah, R. (2023). Bagaimana Mahasiswa NU Memahami Islam Moderat? *AL-MURABBI: Jurnal Studi Kependidikan Dan Keislaman*, 9(2), 12–31. <https://doi.org/10.53627/jam.v9i2.5054>

Ahmad, I. F., Putro, N. H. P. S., Thontowi, Z. S., Syafii, A., & Subakti, M. A. (2020). Trends in the Implementation of Higher-Order Thinking Skills in Islamic Religious Education in Madrasahs and Schools: A Systematic Literature Review. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 9(2), 195–216. <https://doi.org/10.14421/jpi.2020.92.195-216>

Ali, N., Afwadzi, B., Abdullah, I., & Mukmin, M. I. (2021). Interreligious Literacy Learning as a Counter-Radicalization Method: A New Trend among Institutions of Islamic Higher Education in Indonesia. *Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations*, 32(4), 383–405. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09596410.2021.1996978>

Anwar, A., Bakhtiar, B., & Akib, M. (2023). Moderation-Based Education: Efforts to Empower Students in Counteracting Radicalism (A Study at The Tarbiyah Faculty, Parepare State Islamic Institute). *International Journal of Social Science and Human Research*, 06(02), 978–986. <https://doi.org/10.47191/ijsshr/v6-i2-29>

Anwar, R. N., & Muhayati, S. (2021). Upaya Membangun Sikap Moderasi Beragama Melalui Pendidikan Agama Islam Pada Mahasiswa Perguruan Tinggi Umum. *Al-Tadzkiyyah: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 12(1), 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.24042/atjpi.v12i1.7717>

Assa'idi, S. (2021). Religious education curriculum in indonesian islamic university in the digital age: Inceping thematic alquran of fadlur rahman. *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 12(3), 294–311.

Aziz, A. A., Masykur, A., Anam, A. K., Muhtarom, A., Masudi, I., & Duryat, M. (2021). Implementasi Moderasi Beragama dalam Pendidikan (1st ed.). Kelompok Kerja Implementasi Moderasi Beragama Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Islam Kementerian Agama Republik Indonesia.

Aziz, A., & Najmudin, N. (2020). Moderasi Beragama dalam Bahan Ajar Mata Kuliah Pendidikan Agama (PAI) di Perguruan Tinggi Umum Swasta (Studi di STIE Putra Perdana Indonesia Tangerang). *Jurnal Sosial Humaniora*, 6(2), 95–117. <https://jurnal.untirta.ac.id/index.php/JAWARA/article/view/9778/0>

Aziz, S., & Ma'arif, M. J. (2022). Pendidikan Agama Islam dan Masyarakat 5.0: Integrasi Keilmuan Sebagai Metode Penguatan Moderasi Beragama di PTKIS. *Proceeding The Annual Conference on Islamic Religious Education*, Vol. 2 No. 1, 661–669. <http://acied.ppa-indonesia.org/index.php/acied/article/view/58%0Ahttp://acied.ppa-indonesia.org/index.php/acied/article/download/58/54>

Bagas Mukti Nasrowi. (2021). Negara, Ideologi Dan Pendidikan Islam: Kebijakan Negara Dalam Memperkuat Ideologi Islam Moderat. *Darajat: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 4(2), 70–79. <https://doi.org/10.58518/darajat.v4i2.710>

Burhanuddin, N., & Ilmi, D. (2022). Typologies of Religious Moderation in Indonesian Higher Education Institutions. *Journal of Indonesian Islam*, 16(2), 455–479. <https://doi.org/10.15642/JIIS.2022.16.2.455-479>

Daheri, M., Warsah, I., Morganna, R., Putri, O. A., & Adelia, P. (2023). Strengthening Religious Moderation: Learning from the Harmony of Multireligious People in Indonesia. *Journal of Population and Social Studies*, 31, 571–586. <https://doi.org/10.25133/JPSSv312023.032>

Fadholi, A. N., Quraisy, S., & Mukhid, A. (2023). Analisis Penggunaan Metode Diskusi pada Pembelajaran Studi Integratif Materi PAI untuk Penguatan Sikap Moderasi Beragama Mahasiswa PAI A Pasca Sarjana IAIN Madura. *As-Syifa: Journal of Islamic Studies and*

History, 2(2), 157–171. <https://doi.org/10.35132/assyifa.v2i2.534>

Fautanu, I. (2022). Radicalism Among Students: A Study of Perception of Radicalism of Indonesian and Malaysian Students. *Khazanah Sosial*, 4(1), 131–144. <https://doi.org/10.15575/ks.v4i1.17297>

Franken, L. (2018). Islamic religious education in Belgian state schools: a post-secular perspective. *Journal of Beliefs & Values*, 39(2), 132–143. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13617672.2018.1451602>

Fuad, A. J. (2019). Pengembangan Pendidikan Agama Islam pada Perguruan Tinggi Umum Swasta Berbasis Agama. Conference on Islamic Studies FAI 2019, 194–205. <https://doi.org/10.30659/cois.v0i0.8064>

Girin, D.-S. (2021). Islamic Religious Education in France. In *Islamic Religious Education in Europe* (pp. 128–143). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429331039-8>

Hanafi, Y., Hadiyanto, A., Abdussalam, A., Munir, M., Hermawan, W., Qodratulloh, W., Suhendar, Barnansyah, R. M., Anwar, S., Purwanto, Y., & Yani, M. T. (2022). Internalisasi Nilai-Nilai Moderasi Beragama Dalam Perkuliahan Pendidikan Agama Islam Pada Perguruan Tinggi Umum (S. Anwar (ed.); Vol. 2). Delta Pijar Khatulistiwa.

Hasan, K., & Juhannis, H. (2024). Religious education and moderation: A bibliometric analysis. *Cogent Education*, 11(1). <https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2023.2292885>

Hasan, M. A., & Huda, M. (2022). Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam Berbasis Moderasi Beragama dengan Metode Inversi. International Conference of Islamic Education (ICIE), 2, 125–138.

Hasanah, U., & Faddad SZ, Z. (2023). The Philosophical Analysis of the Future of Islamic Higher Education in Indonesia-Malaysia Facing Megatrend 2045. *Al-Fikrah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan*, 11(1), 174. <https://doi.org/10.31958/jaf.v11i1.9307>

Hefni, W., & Ahmadi, R. (2022). Facing Religious Contemporary Challenges: Redefining the Partnership of Islamic Higher Education and Islamic Religious Instructors in Mainstreaming Religious Moderation. *JURNAL PENELITIAN*, 19(2), 109–118. <https://doi.org/10.28918/jupe.v19i2.6161>

Helmy, M. I., Kubro, A. D. J., & Ali, M. (2021). The Understanding of Islamic Moderation (wasatiyyah al-Islam) and the Hadiths on Inter-religious relations in the Javanese Pesantrens. *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies*, 11(2), 377–401. <https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v11i2.377-401>

Herlinawati, H. (2020). The Integration of Religious Moderation Values in Islamic Religious Education Learning at Public Universities (Efforts and Constraints in the Implementation of Anti-Radicalism Education). *SYAMIL: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam (Journal of Islamic Education)*, 8(2), 157–177. <https://doi.org/10.21093/sy.v8i2.2643>

Huda, M., Kurnia, A., Arifin, B. S., & Ruswandi, U. (2023). Implementation of the Values of Religious Moderation in PAI Learning at Madrasah and Islamic Religious College. *Ta Dib Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 12(1), 93–102. <https://doi.org/10.29313/tjpi.v12i1.9097>

Hully, H., Rahman, R., Zikri, A., Irwan, I., Sawaluddin, S., Syafii, A. G., & Yorman, Y. (2023). Internalizing Religious Moderation Values Into The Islamic Education At University. *Journal of Namibian Studies*, 34(S1), 1122–1138. <https://doi.org/10.59670/jns.v34i.2367>

Ikhrom, I., Abdullah, I., Kafipour, R., Mubaraq, Z., & Sutiyono, A. (2023). Intolerance in Islamic textbooks: The quest for an Islamic teaching model for Indonesian schools. *Cogent Education*, 10(2). <https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186X.2023.2268454>

Isya, M. A. (2018). Pendidikan dan Konflik (Potret Konflik Sunni dan Syiah dan imbasnya terhadap Pendidikan di Bangil Kabupaten Pasuruan). *Progressa: Journal of Islamic Religious Instruction*, 2(1), 13–24. <https://doi.org/10.32616/pgr.v2.1.104.13-14>

Jafar, W. A. (2018). Persepsi Masyarakat Kota Bengkulu Terhadap Paham Islam Moderat. *MIZANI: Wacana Hukum, Ekonomi Dan Keagamaan*, 5(1), 75–92. <https://doi.org/10.29300/mzn.v5i1.1438>

Kementerian Agama RI. (2019). Moderasi Beragama. Badan Litbang dan Diklat Kementerian Agama RI.

Latif, M., Syukur, F., Uswatunnisa, U., & Paidi, Z. (2023). The Mainstreaming Policy of Religious Moderation Education in West Sulawesi Province. *International Journal Ihya' 'Ulum Al-Din*, 25(1), 69–81. <https://doi.org/10.21580/ihya.25.1.14150>

Lubis, S., Epandi, R., Tumiran, T., Harahap, M. Y., & Hakim, A. (2023). The Relevance of Jamal Al-Banna's Islamic Legal Thoughts with Religious Moderation in Indonesia. *Al-Istinbath: Jurnal Hukum Islam*, 8(1), 237–252. <https://doi.org/10.29240/jhi.v8i1.6649>

Ma'arif, M. A., Rofiq, M. H., & Sirojuddin, A. (2022). Implementing Learning Strategies for Moderate Islamic Religious Education in Islamic Higher Education. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*, 8(1), 75–86. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v8i1.19037>

Masturin, M. (2023). Development of Islamic Religious Education Materials Based on Religious Moderation in Forming Student Character. *Munaddhomah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan Islam*, 3(4), 246–355. <https://doi.org/10.31538/munaddhomah.v3i4.310>

Muaz, M., & Ruswandi, U. (2022). Moderasi Beragama dalam Pendidikan Islam. *JIIP - Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Pendidikan*, 5(8), 3194–3203. <https://doi.org/10.54371/jiip.v5i8.820>

Muhaemmin, M., Rusdiansyah, R., Pabbajah, M., & Hasbi, H. (2023). Religious Moderation in Islamic Religious Education as a Response to Intolerance Attitudes in Indonesian Educational Institutions. *Journal of Social Studies Education Research*, 14(2), 253–274. <https://jsser.org/index.php/jsser/article/view/4677>

Muhja, Z. A., Kamila, A. T., & Shahnaz, L. (2022). Implementasi Nilai-Nilai Moderasi Beragama dalam Pembelajaran Mata Kuliah Wajib Umum Agama Islam di Universitas Borneo Tarakan. *JIIP - Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Pendidikan*, 5(12), 5673–5681. <https://doi.org/10.54371/jiip.v5i12.1238>

Mulyana, R. (2023). Religious moderation in Islamic religious education textbook and implementation in Indonesia. *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies*, 79(1), 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v79i1.8592>

Mutmainah, M., Humaidi, H., M, N. M., & Zilfa, R. (2023). Analisis Strategi Pendidikan Islam dengan Model Social Learning Dalam Meningkatkan Moderasi Beragama Mahasiswa Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Syaichona Moh. Cholil Bangkalan. *Attanwir: Jurnal Keislaman Dan Pendidikan*, 14(2), 96–107. <https://doi.org/10.53915/jurnalkeislamandanpendidikan.v14i2.439>

Muzaqi, S., A'la, B. A., Makhshun, T., & Ikwandi, M. R. (2022). Model Pembelajaran PAI Berbasis ISRA dalam Meningkatkan Moderasi Beragama Mahasiswa di Perguruan Tinggi. *TA'DIBUNA: Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*, 5(2), 110–128. <https://doi.org/10.30659/jpai.5.2.110-128>

Nabhani, I., Ainissyifa, H., Nasrullah, Y. M., & Fatonah, N. (2023). Implementation of Religious Moderation Values in East Priangan Higher Education. *Hanifiya: Jurnal Studi Agama-Agama*, 6(1), 51–64. <https://doi.org/10.15575/hanifiya.v6i1.24700>

Nasir, M., & Rijal, M. K. (2021). Keeping the middle path: mainstreaming religious moderation through Islamic higher education institutions in Indonesia. *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies*, 11(2), 213–241. <https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v11i2.213-241>

Nugroho, P., & Nailufaz, W. U. (2022). Religious Moderation and Local Religious Content Curriculum: a Study of the Internalization of the Religious Moderation Values in Madrasa. *Penamas: Journal of Religious and Societies*, 35(1), 131–146. <https://doi.org/10.31330/penamas.v35i2.537>

Nyanasuryanadi, P., Kurdi, M. S., Kurdi, M. S., Cakranegara, P. A., Pratama, D., & Nilawati, N. (2023). Mainstreaming the Value of Religious Moderation by Teachers in the Digital Era. *AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan*, 15(2), 1357–1368. <https://doi.org/10.35445/alishlah.v15i2.3198>

Pajarianto, H., Pribadi, I., & Sari, P. (2022). Tolerance between religions through the role of local wisdom and religious moderation. *HTS Teologiese Studies / Theological Studies*, 78(4), a7043. <https://doi.org/10.4102/hts.v78i4.7043>

Purwanto, Y., Qowaid, Ma'rifataini, L., & Fauzi, R. (2019). Internalisasi Nilai Moderasi Melalui Pendidikan Agama Islam di Perguruan Tinggi Umum. *EDUKASI: Jurnal Penelitian*

Pendidikan Agama Dan Keagamaan, 17(2), 110–124.

Rahman, R., Murniyetti, M., & S, W. Q. (2023). Pengembangan nilai moderasi beragama dalam materi akidah pada perkuliahan pendidikan agama Islam di Universitas Negeri Padang. Humanika: Jurnal Ilmiah Kajian Humaniora, 23(2), 211–216. <https://doi.org/10.21831/hum.v23i2.65538.211-216>

Rahmat, R., & Khoiriyah, M. (2023). Moderasi dalam Pembelajaran Agama Islam di Madrasah dan Perguruan Tinggi. Al-Liqo: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam, 8(1), 121–148. <https://doi.org/10.46963/alliqo.v8i1.835> This

Rokhmad, A. (2019). The Sunni-Shia Conflict in Madura Indonesia: Judging Individual Faith as Blasphemy. Pertanika Journal of Social Sciences & Humanities, 27(3), 2081–2097.

Rosidin, Mibtadin, Rachmadhani, A., Najib, Yuwono, D. B., Nuriyanto, L. K., Sugiyarto, W., & Marpuah. (2023). Views And Practices of Religious Moderation Tafsir Al Qur An Assembly Surakarta Indonesia. Migration Letters, 20(3), 522–533. <https://doi.org/10.47059/ml.v20i3.2935>

Saada, N. (2023). Educating for global citizenship in religious education: Islamic perspective. International Journal of Educational Development, 103. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2023.102894>

Sakir, A. (2022). Esensi Pendidikan Agama Islam Dalam Profil Pelajar Pancasila. Jurnal Inovasi Pembelajaran Dan Manajemen Pendidikan, 2(1), 50–56. <http://bpmpkaltara.kemdikbud.go.id>

Sanusi, S., & Fatah, A. (2022). Pengarusutamaan Moderasi Beragama dalam Pengembangan Kurikulum PAI Berbasis Paradigma Ilmu Islam Terapan di IAIN Kudus. 2st ICIE: International Conference on Islamic Education, 2, 79–98. <http://103.35.140.33/index.php/ICIE/article/view/129>.

Saputra, I. N., Hardi, A. R., & Rahmat, R. (2023). Sikap Intoleransi pada Kehidupan Beragama di Indonesia, Studi Kasus 'Cilegon, Kota Tanpa Gereja'. Jurnal Kajian Islam Kontemporer, 1(2), 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.31219/osf.io/gzf9x>

Shihab, M. Q. (2020). Wasathiyah: Wawasan Islam tentang Moderasi Beragama. Lentera Hati.

Sijamhodžić-Nadarević, D. (2023). Contribution of Islamic Religious Education to Intercultural Values in Pluralistic European Cultures: Insights from Bosnia and Herzegovina. Religions, 14(4). <https://doi.org/10.3390/rel14040453>

Sirry, M. (2020). Muslim Student Radicalism and Self-Deradicalization in Indonesia. Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations, 31(2), 241–260. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09596410.2020.1770665>

Sodikin, A., & Ma`arif, M. A. (2021). Penerapan Nilai Islam Moderat Dalam Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam di Perguruan Tinggi. EDUKASI: Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Agama Dan Keagamaan, 19(2), 187–203. <https://doi.org/10.32729/edukasi.v19i2.702>

Suhayib, & Ansyari, M. F. (2023). Design of Islamic Religious Education: Purposes, alignment of curriculum components and contexts. British Journal of Religious Education, 45(4), 382–393. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2023.2220940>

Suwendi, S., Shobikah, N., Faisal, M., & Muttaqin, I. (2023). Strengthening Religious Moderation As Effort To Prevent Extremism In Education Institution. Journal of Namibian Studies: History Politics Culture, 34, 3810–3824. <https://doi.org/10.59670/jns.v34i.1934>

Suyudi, M., & Putra, W. H. (2022). Implementation of Islamic Education Based on Religious Moderation Through Tri Dharma Activities at Islamic Religious College. AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan, 14(1), 189–202. <https://doi.org/10.35445/alishlah.v14i1.1553>

Thoriquttyas, T., Saputra, M., Huda, I., Hanafi, Y., & Zaimatus, N. (2020, November 11). Strengthening the Religious Moderation through Innovation of Islamic Religious Education (IRE) based Civic Intelligence and the Values Clarification Technique (VCT). KnE Social Sciences. <https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v4i14.7878>

Tuna, M. H. (2022). The professionalisation of Islamic religious education teachers. British Journal of Religious Education, 44(2), 188–199. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2021.1999905>

Widiawati, N., Neni, W., & Idris, I. (2022). Asesmen Pembelajaran selama Masa Pandemi: A Systematic Literature. *Jurnal Penelitian Ilmu Pendidikan*, 15(2), 165-177. <https://doi.org/10.21831/jpipfip.v15i2.49523>

Woeleert, P., Vidovich, L., & O'Donoghue, T. (2022). Breaking the mould: a comparative study of 'radical' university curriculum reforms in a context of global-local policy flows. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 1-19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057925.2022.2092720>

Zaduqisti, E., Mashuri, A., Zuhri, A., Haryati, T. A., & Ula, M. (2020). On being moderate and peaceful: Why Islamic political moderateness promotes outgroup tolerance and reconciliation. *Archive for the Psychology of Religion*, 42(3), 359-378. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0084672420931204>